

YEREL KALKINMADA
KÜLTÜR VE YARATICILIK

CULTURE AND CREATIVITY
FOR LOCAL DEVELOPMENT

REPORT REPORT REPORT REPORT

SINOPALF

SINOPALE FORUM:
CULTURE AND CREATIVITY
FOR LOCAL DEVELOPMENT
REPORT

This is the report of “**Sinopale Forum Culture and Creativity in Urban Development**” activity, which has been realized 12TH-17TH January 2016.

Editor **Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici**

Editing **Cansu Kircan**

Translation **Çiğdem Girgiç**

Reading **Erman Topgöl, Nilüfer Sülüner**

Photographs **Doğancan Güzer, Erkan Aklıman, Ghazaal Bagheri**

Sinopale Forum is an activity by European Cultural Association.

Production **Chameleon Design and Project Management**

Project Development and Management **D.I. Mahir Namur, Prof. Dr. T. Melih Görgün**

Project Team **Melek Tuğru Hekimoğlu, Erman Topgöl, Yeşim Uzunöz, Yusuf Emre Yalçın, Erkan Aklıman, Suzan Atasever, Güngör Erdem, Mert Karaçıkay, Yiğit Bahadır Kaya, Cansu Kircan, Elif Kuli, Nilüfer Sülüner, Çağatay Şimşek, Oğulcan Üvet, Ayça Açıkgöz**

Activity Coordinators **Elif Kuli, Erman Topgöl**

Activity Assistants **Güneş Şenyeşil, Dilan Saray, Neşe Altınal, Şule Tekkol, Anıl Tuhanoğlu, Ebru Güler, Hande Gürderen**

Exhibition **T. Melih Görgün, Nilüfer Sülüner, Güngör Erdem, Nil İlkbaşaran**

Movies “**Tarzan Kemal Story of A Citizen**” **Yusuf Emre Yalçın**
“**Oral History and Documentary Film Workshop**”,
Erkan Aklıman

Sinopsis **Yiğit Bahadır Kaya [Editör], Çağın Kaya [Design]**

Marketing and Communication Consultants **Lale Atat, Elif Tepebaşı**

Web **Erman Topgöl**

PR **Haber Atölyesi**

Interpreters **Çiğdem Girgiç, Özge Taylan**

Academic Support **Prof. Dr. Aziz Konukman, Ass. Prof. Alpay Tırıl, Prof. Dr. Fatma Ünsal, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ, Ass. Prof. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan**

ISBN 978-605-88140-7-3

YEREL KALKINMADA
KÜLTÜR VE YARATICILIK

CULTURE AND CREATIVITY
FOR LOCAL DEVELOPMENT

İNÖNÜ
ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SİNOPALE

RE-
PORT
RE-
PORT
RE-
PORT

JANUARY 12, 2016, Tuesday, Istanbul

“Policies and Actions”

SESSION 1: DEVELOPMENT PERSPECTIVES

What are the existing governmental and municipal development policies? Which methods and tools can be used to transform Sinop to a city of “culture and education tourism”?

- Moderator:** Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale, Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University MSGSÜ)
- Participants:** Dr. Yasemin Özata Çetinkaya (Governor of Sinop)
Baki Ergül (Mayor of Sinop)
Mustafa Bozdemir (Rep. of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, General Directorate of Cultural Heritage and Museums Deputy General Manager)
Berkol Alevli (KUZKA, Coordinator)
- Reflections:** Prof. Dr. Aziz Konukman (Gazi University)
Prof. Dr. Fatma Ünsal (MSGSÜ)
- Recorded by:** Ass. Prof Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Dr. Yasemin Özata Çetinkaya [Governor of Sinop]:

She offered insight on development strategies by sharing data on Sinop city and its center:

Sinop is the 59th largest city in Turkey.

It has a population of 204.526 and is 72nd city in Turkey in terms of population.

45% of the population still resides in rural areas and villages.

It is 9th city in Turkey in terms of rural population which creates a unique and very important potential in regards to current population mobility in Turkey in general.

There are 470 villages in total within the borders of Sinop city and 6.666 students commute to centers from their villages via vehicles.

Such opportunities enable people to continue to reside in villages.

Although the population continues to increase, out migration continues too. There are approximately 300.000 people from Sinop who continue to live in Istanbul.

The rate of population over 65 is 17.6%. It is one of the cities in Turkey which has the highest rate in this regard but this has no negative impact on investments made on youth.

Educational indicators are very high. Sinop is 20th city in Turkey among

successful cities in central placement exams (high schools and universities).

Economy of Sinop is provided by agriculture 71%, services 20% and industry sector 5%.

The variety of agricultural is few: First comes forest products, sea food is second and paddy (brown rice) is third.

56% of Sinop's surface is registered forest land. It is the 7th city in Turkey in terms of forest covered areas with very high income from forests.

Tourism comes first to provide for the service sector.

The city has 100 hotels in total with an approximate capacity of 400 rooms but the number of visitors mounts up to 1 million people. The gap is covered by entrepreneurs of bed and breakfasts. The city is caught unprepared in terms of tourism. The infrastructure is insufficient and the season is limited to three months only.

In regards to sectoral development in the future,

- It seems forestry will continue to be important and raise its income.
- Fishing industry will improve based upon raising awareness of fishers to protect resources.
- Ayancık and environs are rare places in Turkey where no pesticides, chemical fertilizers are used in agriculture. If steps can be taken for ecological agriculture, significant development can be attained.
- Attempts have been initiated in tourism to draw attention of daily visitors and tourists from neighboring cities. The first goals set include extending time for tourism season and attract tourists with high added values. Furthermore it is hopeful that local values are mobilized.

Baki Ergül [Mayor of Sinop]:

He has conveyed the future goals and projects established in Sinop by Municipality:

The city is connected to its own region and other cities much stronger than the past thanks to the investments in Sinop made on transportation.

Sinop should share its beauties (natural life, peaceful environment, and organic life) with its periphery but it should not turn into Bodrum or Marmaris and it should grow slowly absorbing this change.

Sinop's future depends on tourism and education.

The projects implemented by Municipality support the supra and infrastructures of the city making it a real true city. Such projects include as follows:

- Clean potable water infrastructure has been completed. Tap water is potable water.
- Sewage and pre-treatment deep sea discharge systems are about to be completed.
- Development plan is completed and will be discussed in the Parliament in February 2016.
- Ordu, Korucu, Bostancılı and Osmaniye villages will be included in Sinop city limits under neighborhood status. So, new urban development areas will be obtained fast to allow city population to grow.
- Ada Neighborhood will be divided into two to provide it with better services.
- A road project is in question to open Northern shores to touristic development. Negotiations with Ankara on this matter continue.
- A yacht marina project with app. 70 yacht capacity and a marina with 70 boat capacity are being discussed.
- Possibilities for a solid waste sorting facility are being studied.
- An asphalt plant is built.
- Market space is improved.
- Slaughterhouse will be opened in May 2016.
- A building located on Kuruçeşme Street donated by a philanthropist is being restored. There are other projects for other buildings too.
- Pedestrianization and face-lifting project for Sakarya Street is funded by KUZKA. Traffic will run on one lane with new arrangements to be made.
- A cultural axis will be created to link Ice House and harbor launch with Sinop Historical Prison.

- Formerly existing Ice House port will be rebuilt.
- Sinop is a city that invested its future in tourism and education.
Tourism season should be increased to include 7-8 months.

***Mustafa Bozdemir [Rep. of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism,
General Directorate of Cultural Heritage and Museums
Deputy General Manager]:***

He explained the content of Sinop Prison Field Management Project in detail.

Berkol Alevli [KUZKA, Coordinator]:

He explained the vision and projects by KUZKA developed for the region and Sinop:

- Vision set for Sinop: “Region’s compass, reference point for authentic ideas.”
- It is planned to set Sinop as “City of Sea” in regards to tourism.
- Sustainable development is planned.
- Marina project near Sinop harbor is one of the significant plans.
- Parallel goals for tourism include landscaping, development of social activities, increasing number and qualities of hotels.
- KUZKA runs promotional activities by attending tourism fairs in Dubai to attract Arab tourists into the region.
- It is planned to start an R&D team for tourism.
- Gerze will possibly become a “Citta Slow”.

Comments and Evaluations:

Baki Ergül [Mayor of Sinop]: He stated that urgent resources were required for restoration of Sinop Castle Towers in the framework of field management works.

Aziz Konukman [Gazi Uni.]:

It is essential that natural data should be utilized for the development of Sinop. So, the development plan prepared by KUZKA is very valuable in terms of participation, dialogue and environmental sensitivity in energy generation in this regard.

* Central administration also has projects and investment ideas for Sinop and environs. Common consensus can be established if benefit and cost of such projects are shared publicly and supported by scientific data. This issue was taken to KUZKA during Industrial Development Workshop. Have there been any attempts by KUZKA on this matter?

Renewable energy resources and related investments in this field have priority in the project prepared by KUZKA. Wind power comes first. Feasibility studies on wind power investments are about to be concluded [*Berkol Alevli*].

Fatma Ünsal (MSGSÜ):

Geographic distance and isolation due to Sinop's position created a serious feeling of belonging. Level of being organized and will to participate is quite high. But there is unwillingness for entrepreneurship which needs to be overrun.

Tourism is an important potential for the region but this is a very vulnerable/fragile sector. Whatever happens has a direct impact on tourism sector due to Turkey's geopolitical position. So town economy cannot solely depend on tourism. It is important to have multi sector economy.

Private sector-public cooperation can be built to transfer funds and resources to public. Thus both public and private sector will win.

It is necessary to target young population by considering venue quality. At this point:

* What kind of a relationship is there between upper scale decisions and micro projects and development?

State should also support Sinop for development and take steps to encourage the investors. There should be incentive measures taken such as 10 year long tax exemption or insurance exemption

* It is a positive improvement that development plan is on the way but is there an approach integrating public space and bringing projects together?

There is a project to move the Provincial Hall located in the center of Sinop and Courthouse as well to the outskirts of the city on new development areas and rearrange the city square and convert these buildings into cultural centers. Administrative center of the city will be moved to the new development area [*Baki Ergül*].

SESSION 2: DEVELOPING SINOP

What are the actions taken in Sinop by different stakeholders? What are their potential influences on Sinop's sustainable development? What can be done to improve their influence?

- Moderator:** Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)
- Participants:** Prof. Dr. Christoph Luchsinger (Vienna University of Technology)
Prof. Dr. Manfred Wehdorn (Wehdorn Architekten)
Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale Artistic Director, MSGSÜ)
Cansu Kircan (Sinop Sustainable Development Association)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)
Prof. Dr. Gülgün Koroğlu (Balatlar Archeological Excavation Site Manager)
- Reflections:** Prof. Dr. Aziz Konukman (Gazi Uni.)
Prof. Dr. Fatma Ünsal (MSGSÜ)
Seda Erden (European Commission Turkish Delegation)
Hasan Onur (Founder of Sinop History and Cultural Researches Association)
- Recorded by:** Ass. Prof. Dr. Alpay Tırlı (Sinop Uni.)

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna University of Technology]:

Prof. Dr. Christoph Luchsinger who is in charge of urban planning part of Field Management Project, presented Sinop city strategy they have prepared briefly (detailed presentation will be made on January 14, Thursday):

Planned work has three legs as in large, medium and small scale. Small scale: Historical Prison; medium scale: Inner citadel; large scale: Outer citadel.

It is suggested to build a marina on the southern shore of Sinop Historical Prison and small buildings on the northern shore.

Some suggestions were made for public spaces by dividing the city into seven sections. For example it is suggested to build a park on the area currently used as harbor launch.

Manfred Wehdorn [Wehdorn Architekten]:

Prof. Dr. Manfred Wehdorn presented the project as the project owner of Sinop Historical Prison restoration project tendered to the budget financed by EU in the scope of Sinop Field Management project:

Urban development in Sinop is evaluated in its social terms.

Developments in landscaping and buildings are evaluated in

terms of citizen consciousness.

In an example from abroad, a group of town dwellers gathered in an outdoor public space watch an activity sitting on the ground. You don't always need architectural elements for public spaces to function.

Historical city center, city walls, Historical Prison and harbor are important components for Sinop forming the city. But these components have to be analyzed together with landscape and urban dwellers.

Three important elements of Sinop city landscape include inner city waterfront line, beaches and city outdoor public spaces. The basic goal of the project is the integrity of these three elements.

Sinop Historical Prison is studied in line with the feedback from local stakeholders during field management project period to develop a design to convert it into a multifunctional cultural center. Historical Prison will become a multifunctional cultural center as a result of this design.

The project basis is to transform Sinop Historical Prison into a culture and art center of which urban dwellers and especially youth becomes a part.

Historical Prison consisting of three blocks should integrate with public.

- It is suggested to spare the first section of the building for the works of artists participating in culture and art activities. There will be a residence for artists.
- It is suggested to spare the second section of the building for culture and art activities. The building should be a center functioning 24/y if possible. It is also suggested to preserve the outer part of this section and have the interior converted into a multifunctional hall supported by steel construction.
- Third section of the building is designed to be a museum with minimum intervention in restoration.

It is suggested to demolish the workshops located in the eastern part of the prison complex to be used as a space for stands to sell souvenirs of local handicrafts.

It is suggested to spare the juvenile hall to be used for children

activities.

It is suggested to use the observation rooms for cultural and art activities.

It is suggested to convert the Turkish bath into a cafe.

T. Melih Görgün [European Cultural Association, Sinopale Artistic Director, MSGSÜ]:

“Culture and Art in Urban Development”

Prof. Dr. T. Melih Görgün started his presentation by telling his dream for Sinop which is his birthplace and where he stayed connected after his college education:

My dream has been to contribute to the development of Sinop one day where I had been born and grew up in with the experience I had. The idea of a “biennale” was born 11 years ago when we have visited Sinop with a group of friends including academicians, artists, civil society organization representatives, theatre directors and curators to make “something” that we did not know of. The first biennale was held in Sinop Historical Prison in 2006 called as “Sinopale”.

Sinopale is an art event with wide participation based on local, national and international collaboration. It is one of the most innovative biennales among international ones located off-centre. Sinopale brought a different approach to the concept of biennale with “local, national and international collaboration”.

Sinopale does not only consist of exhibitions but allows sharing information by bringing people from all walks of life, organize workshops, brings art and art lovers together. Sinopale uses its own name as it is based on sharing.

Children are very important for Sinopale too.

Sinopale is a space and process oriented biennale. It offers a new model as a process experienced, shared and produced by all participants all together. It features information. All artistic experiences, life processes, local rituals of daily life are used in different art events in different forms.

Several art works had been created throughout Sinopale as a result of

widely participated collaboration which is based on participation and sharing of all urban dwellers of all ages. The concept to be underlined here is “collective voluntary work - imece”.

This process using local resources is an intense cultural production period involving international partners and supporters. It includes modest activities rather than comprehensive large exhibitions. It establishes a new productive process bringing contemporary art and daily life experience together. So, it brings a new vision to the traditional art market known to consist of art galleries and art spectators.

Local knowledge and collective work remain in the forefront for Sinopale. Sinopale allows civil society to meet in an art environment. It empowers the urban civilian movement. Artists use an international art language in their workshops to enable local problems to be visible. So the city dwellers start to confide in themselves since everybody produces together. Compared to other biennales, Sinopale’s structure allows urban dwellers to participate in the production process.

This method is used to develop assisting international projects where Sinopale is also included in. Thanks to Sinopale, Sinop is renown in art and cultural circles all around the world. Sinopale participates in several international meetings, educational activities and conventions in Amsterdam, Vienna, Venice, Athens, Dublin, Berlin, Lyon, Zürich, Sofia, Munich and many others. This is a benefit no city can obtain with large budgets.

Sinopale also publishes activity booklets, a daily newspaper and a fanzine prepared and published by a group of volunteers.

HAL has become the activity center. Wholesale Market Hall/HAL building is one of several tangible assets of Sinopale. Our future events will be held at HAL building.

Another activity of Sinopale is “Ayda 1 Gün Sokak Bizim /Street Belongs to Us Once a Month”. One street is closed to traffic on certain day of the month since 2014 for several activities.

Cansu Kircan [Sinop Sustainable Development Association]:

Cansu Kircan explained the functional transformation process of HAL which is a building from 1950's in Sinop in her presentation titled "HAL, Sinop Meeting Center Project" on behalf of Sinop Sustainable Development Association:

This building has been used as a wholesale market hall for fruit and vegetables and it was donated by Muharrem Tansel to be used for Sinop's benefit to the Municipality.

It has lost its function today. The building hosts some merchants such as a grocery store, butcher, and tailor as well some civil society organizations, a sculpture artist and shops used by the municipality. It has become less used in time.

HAL building became important again as Sinopale claimed it. Sinopale started to work to transform this place into "HAL, Sinop Meeting Center" together with Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts, Street Belongs To Us Association (Sokak Bizim Derneği) and many local civil society organizations.

HAL building is being transformed into a space with a new function to serve the goal to make Sinop "A City of Training and Culture" for "Culture Based Sustainable Development".

In order to attain the goal of sustainable development, it is required for civil society, public, universities and private sector to work in collaboration with each other. HAL is the meeting space for these actors in Sinop.

HAL Meeting Center consists of units which are administered and coordinated by Sinop Sustainable Development Association. Other units include Media Center, Sinopale, Social Entrepreneurship Platform, Training Center, Design Center and Center for Urban Memory and Researches.

All units work in collaboration with each other to start social initiatives such as:

- Society Based Tourism Network:

It aims to build a society based tourism model in Sinop by encouraging bed & breakfast entrepreneurship and small size tourism entrepreneurship.

In line with this purpose:

It builds coordination between boutique hotels, bed & breakfasts, rental homes, flats and rooms.

It sets and controls quality criteria.

It also provides services for common purchases, cleaning, repair; web based sales and reservation.

- Hal Shop:

It aims to revalue and protect lost cultural products and to add value to the economy.

In line with this purpose it works together with Design Workshop for sales and marketing of designs and products exclusive to Sinop.

Local and foreign designers were invited to Sinop recently. Working together with craftsmen and craftswomen, artists and small scale producers in Sinop, new products are designed with the slogan “Smells Like Sinop” and branding was created for current products. All products resulting from all this work are displayed at HAL Shop. They will be commercialized in the future to contribute to local development.

- Kitchen Workshop:

It aims to support Sinop’s local food culture to create sustainable economically benefits.

In line with this purpose:

Local food and ingredients in Sinop are studied and subjected to research.

Workshops with cooks are held.

A special menu exclusive to Sinop is created at the end of this workshop.

This menu is served at a restaurant that will be opened.

- Beekeeping Workshop: Güngör Erdem will explain this at the session to be held on January 16, Saturday.

- Gardening Workshop: We are not presenting this initiative which aims to beautify the city since it is not finalized.

Hal, Sinop Meeting Center is just at the bottom of the ladder and is about to be transformed. We started our path thanks to your support. We wish your support to continue and increase.

* We were going to demolish the building to build a shopping mall instead. We decided to transform it into a Meeting Center upon the suggestions. I am glad that we decided that way. *[Baki Ergöl]*

Bahar Aksel Enşici [MSGSÜ]:

Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici from Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts, Vice Manager of Creative Industries Application and Research Center explained 2014 Sinop Summer School held with the participation of Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts students in her presentation titled “Sinop: Culture and Tourism Based Development”:

Subjects mentioned in the conceptual work of summer school prepared in Istanbul are summarized in three main titles as in creative industries, tourism and public space.

Creative industries are studied in terms of their conceptual analysis, contribution to city economy and spatial dimension.

Tourism is studied in terms of sustainable tourism approach, enabling integrity of different tourism types and innovative approaches.

Public space is studied in terms of urban rights and reinterpreting it as a part of social urban transformation strategy.

Analysis and evaluation on Sinop were finalized as well as meetings with actors and participatory meetings.

As a result of all that work a map is created that can be utilized as Sinop’s “Identity Map”. Information has been presented on a map marked with colored pins indicating perception of Sinopians on the city and their spatial belonging.

Colored pins on the map indicate answers to questions asked to people of Sinop on where they live, they visit most, eat most, favorite places, most dangerous places.

A graphic presentation summarized outline of Sinop’s history, some natural fields of Sinop perceived to be important, sightseeing locations and memory spots.

Then analysis of areas such as tourism and education where Sinop seems to remain in the forefront is explained through graphics.

According to the study group's statements, most visited historical and touristic locations in Sinop are (in mixed order):

İnceburun, Akliman, Sarıkum, Hamsilos, Erfelek Waterfalls, Akgöl, İnaltı Cave, Boyabat Castle, Historical Prison, Alaattin Mosque, Archaeology Museum, Ethnography Museum, Pervane Medrassah, Seyit Bilâl Tomb, Balatlar Church.

Leading components of Sinop's touristic potential are stated to be sea, culture, plateau, and cave, hunting and fishing as well as gastronomic elements.

Problems of tourism sector are mentioned to be local tourists mostly consisting of the tourist profile, short stay of tourists and their low contribution in economy, infrastructural problems occurring at the end of tourism season, lack of promotional activity, insufficient number of beds, traditional activities not being reflected into tourism, insufficient training for sector employees, cruise tourism not being a significant contribution in city economy.

The number of visitors between 2007 and 2013 is mentioned where number of tourists in 2007 has been 382.900 which increased annually to reach 870.701 in 2013.

Fishing in Sinop has an important potential.

Gülgün Köroğlu (Balatlar Archeological Site Manager, MSGSÜ):

Prof. Dr. Gülgün Köroğlu told about the Balatlar Building group excavation she has been running since 2010 and features of the site:

The excavation site known as "Balatlar Church" in public and scientific publications for long years is the most important archaeological site located in the outer citadel area of the city defined as a result of the excavation work.

Located in Sinop city center, the excavation site consists of important group of buildings used in Roman, Byzantine, Seljukid and Ottoman periods. Upon the permission by Ministry of Culture and Tourism, the excavation works started in 2010 with the

leadership of Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts Faculty Member Prof. Dr. Gülgün Köroğlu uncovering sections of the building from different periods which were partially visible earlier and many small findings were gathered at the excavation from different periods.

Since there is dense settlement around the excavation area, sections located under high rise apartment buildings were beyond our reach. Empty lots around were expropriated to be included in excavation site.

The field chronology is as follows based on the findings located at Balatlar Buildings Group:

- Late Hellenistic-Early Roman period (1 B.C- 1 A.D)
- Roman Empire period bath building (3-4 A.D.)
- Late Roman-Early Byzantine period church (Roman Bath's caldarium) (End of 4th century A.D. -6th century A.D.)
- Early Byzantine period ceramic-glass workshop
- 7th century chapel and burial chamber
- 13th century church and its graveyard
- Greek Orthodox Monastery Church (14th century –first quarter of 20th century)
- Greek Orthodox Graveyard (18th century-first quarter of 20th century)

Main building in the excavation site is a Roman bath which has structural features of a monumental Roman bath. Two large spaces with a basilica plan and rectangular large hall have been unearthed.

Caldarium of the building built as an Imperial Bath in late Roman period had been converted into a church at the end of 4th century or beginning of 5th century and its tepidarium had been used as the church courtyard.

A new chapel had been added to the southern wing of the basilica later (probably in the beginning of 7th century) and a burial chamber to its north. It is not known when this section had been used as a church.

There is another building in the complex used as a monastery church which had been in use since 12th or 13th century until Greek

population left Sinop due to Treaty of Lausanne.

There is a late Ottoman period graveyard under the whole excavation site right under the surface earth dated between 18th and 20th centuries. 3 m thick rubble wreckage has been reached right under this graveyard level.

New architectural ruins have been spotted in the west of the building group as a result of our work.

Since Seljuk coins dated to the first quarter of 13th century were found in the west of the building group during the 2015 excavations, it is thought that stones were gathered from this point to be used in fortification of the inner citadel or city walls.

Prof. Dr. Gülgün Köroğlu also gave information on the graves found as the site was also used as a graveyard. Köroğlu mentioned grave gifts found in some of the graves and interestingly a cat skeleton had been found in one of the graves with a bird and a mouse skeleton in cat's stomach. Other important artifacts also have been found in the graveyard area.

SESSION 3: REFLECTIONS AND DAY'S REVIEW

Fatma Ünsal [MSGSÜ]:

It is very important for Sinop to improve creative industries.

Claiming and embracing the city as well as feeling of belonging are very important. People living in Sinop have much stronger feeling of belonging than other cities.

Aziz Konukman [Gazi Uni.]:

There is a project never mentioned so far contradicting all subjects covered in Sinopale Forum which is the nuclear power plant. It is a significant evaluation that this project had not been included in local planning processes. Both KUZKA and the agency plans on Sinop state that nuclear power plant does not exist. It cannot be ignored; those who put the nuclear power plant into the agenda are responsible to discuss it with its pros and cons in public.

I am against the nuclear power plant but those who are for it should explain their arguments in public to create a transparent discussion medium.

Nuclear power plant demand does not appear in local development plans and it is centrally enforced.

Environmental consciousness and local level of being organized in Sinop is quite high.

Seda Erden [European Commission Turkish Delegation]:

When the Ministry of Culture and Tourism added the idea of European Union Project implemented in Sinop into the agenda, the first question that comes to mind is “Why Sinop?” They were convinced that Sinop is a likely choice when they started interviewing the parties in Sinop.

Civil society structuring and level of being organized in Sinop are very strong. It is also confirmed by the fact that all parties had come together to apply for an EU project.

Hasan Onur (Founder of Sinop History and Cultural Researches Association):

Sinop has a very rich historical past which is an important value and

potential: “Sinop’s future lies in its past.”

All informed and conscious people raised by Sinop should return to
Sinop to serve the city.

January 13, 2016, Wednesday, Istanbul

“Local Economic Development Models and Best Practices”

SESSION 1: CAN THE CONCEPT OF CREATIVE CITY BE APPLIED TO BOTTOM UP SUSTAINABLE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES? WHICH ALTERNATIVE ECONOMIES CAN BE BORN OUT OF THESE?

Moderator: Yeşim Dizdaroğlu (General Manager/ÇEKÜL Environment and Culture Foundation)

Participants: Sacha Kagan (Luneburg University)
Cristina da Milano (Culture Action Europe, Brussels)
Branca Neves (Lisbon Municipality)
Alp Arısoy (Urban Studies Coordinator/ÇEKÜL Foundation)

Reflections: Rarita Zbranca (Cluj – European Capital of Culture)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ (MSGSÜ)
Assoc. Prof Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan (Bilgi University)

Recorded by: Assoc. Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Sacha Kagan [Luneburg University]:

“Creative city” concept requests a neoliberal urban planning underlining certain sectors and leaving other sectors behind. Therefore *creative city* actually is not a sustainable concept.

At this point “resilient cities” concept emerges which would be cities that can act more flexible and have less chance of being affected by changes.

We should focus more on the concept of “Creative Sustainable Cities” rather than “Sustainable Creative Cities”. Thus it will be possible for the whole society to be more creative, fed by culture and arts; there can be a social benefit for larger masses rather than a certain class supporting a single sector.

It is essential to allow spatial arrangements enabling different possibilities. There should be space for individuals to express themselves, dream and make them true or have different experiences. Only then, it would be possible to create an environment enabling creativity or new ideas to emerge.

Cultural sustainability requires “*cost action networking*”.

It requires culture in / for / as sustainable development. Definitions should be flexible depending on the area of work and situation available. Situations, cities or activities both change depending on space and may change in time. Sustainable development can only be possible if a flexible approach is embraced without being

stuck in one of these.

The biggest advantage that culture and arts may provide sustainability with is that it offers the chance of a dialogue between different actors, to be organized and increase current communication.

Cristina da Milano (Culture Action Europe):

It sounds right to use “Sustainability” as a concept rather than

“Sustainable development” as sustainability concept is more holistic and does not only underline an economic development.

It includes society-culture-environment and economy altogether.

The concept of “culture” is essential especially in terms of sustainability.

It is required to think of it as actual work and an approach culture rather than a sector which needs to become more common and generalized. It is also essential that culture needs to be shaped multi-sectorally within cross relationships.

For development, “*shared economy*” is necessary. Its most important part is creating audience development but this audience should not only consist of well educated, middle/upper economic class individuals. All individuals in a society should be natural parts and audience of culture and arts. So, participation is essential for that and for participation, information sharing and owning are required.

Creativity on the other hand should feed the culture as a stimulant of such process and support its development.

* Do decision makers see creative partnerships as a strategic tool for social and business investments?

Culture and cultural heritage should be utilized not only for tourism but on long term basis for the participation, belonging of the society to be claimed by it.

It is a reality that tourism has become an industry today which needs to be accepted. In many countries administrative unit of “Ministry of Culture and Tourism” handles culture and tourism under the same umbrella. This is not an important problem. But “cultural” policies and approach should change. Culture’s social role

should be put in the front of matters; otherwise the growth and development over tourism are limited.

Questions from the audience:

* Is it possible to take “development” out of sustainability totally?

If quantitative growth can be off its mark and start a cycle of development, co-evaluation even at a balance, we can continue to use it. Concepts of development and growth should not be understood in their modern meaning.

* What is the biggest problem in creative partnership?

First of all, it is the lack of vision and long-term policies. As long as the policies are short term basis, immediate results would be required. But cultural investments don't have short term return since their impact is revealed in the long term.

Branca Neves [Lisbon Municipality]:

Lisbon Municipality supports policies for information based studies and entrepreneurship. Creative services have a map of location choices in Lisbon city. So clusters and infrastructural distribution/needs are clearly visible.

Based on R.Florida's 3T approach, Lisbon has the following potentials:

- Talent: It is essential to spot down students and new graduates as well as professionals which includes Erasmus exchange students and independent researchers.
- Tolerance: It is an important potential for a city if it is multicultural and intercultural. You need to be proud of that situation. For example 15 different cultures coexist in Lisbon.
- Technology: Techno-city investments are supported in the city.

Besides all that, it is essential to create quality public spaces.

Using the industrial heritage and abandoned buildings as publicly open cultural spaces filled with activities have a positive impact on city's creative and cultural atmosphere.

On the other side, the Municipality also runs different projects. Owned by the Municipality, “Start Up Lisbon” is a center supporting entrepreneurship bringing 40 mentors, 50 partners (banks, private sector etc.) and people with business ideas together. Employment

is created thanks to the business ideas implemented here. The steps of this project seem very similar to what had been done in Sinop so far.

Alp Arisoy [Urban Studies Coordinator / ÇEKÜL Foundation]:

The balance between protection-utilization matters a lot in development of cities which is the most delicate part of development.

Cities should develop by protecting what protects cultural heritage and produces culture. Which culture is to be reproduced in the process of multi cultures and how shall we produce that? Can we use that as a tool for spatial changes?

Culture can only collectively be produced and shared in public spaces. So the priority should be changing and functionalizing outdoor / indoor public spaces rather than restoring buildings.

All work done in examples of Merzifon and Payas and their results are shared.

Reflections and Evaluation:

Rarita Zbranca [Cluj – European Capital of Culture]:

Culture is an essential tool in many senses. “Shared Economy” may work for Sinop but it would not be “Creative City” as Creative Class demands and behavior are variable. So how are we going to meet the demands of true and real (even local) actors and their varying demands / needs and establish a welfare state? We should look for the methods for that.

Kevser Üstündağ [MSGSÜ]:

Most important thing required is to be flexible to conduct these processes with different expansions. Besides we need to perceive culture not just as an answer but a question too. Our method for results should be asking many questions such as which culture, how etc.

Local administrations may not be supporting such issues and investments in Turkey. What we need to consider is how we influence and include them.

Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan [Bilgi University]:

In order to enable culture to develop at the required level, participation and stakeholder management should be considered and even followed.

Most important of 3T's for creative cities is tolerance since the communicative environment it creates feeds the whole system and support its development.

Sinop has an authentic structure that can create its own environment and energy. This needs to be developed. On the other hand there is an inevitable competition. But sustainability is not possible if adaptability and flexibility cannot be attained under competition conditions.

* How does Lisbon decide on the projects to support?

Individuals or groups submit projects to the local administration. These projects are discussed and voted at meetings with large participation. Regional residents are definitely included in the discussion to vote as well. Voting is done over the phone or directly. So participation is enabled. Project resources are funded by the municipality budget.

* Putting work into a project is required to own it. This work can be in many ways as in taking action or financial support. Actually participants also work for each other not just for the project. Collective work and participation result in collaboration. On the other hand, communication is a must for sustainability. Basic goal is to achieve a positive change which has the will in its basis. Everybody needs to have the will to listen to and learn from everyone in order to succeed *(Mahir Namur)*.

* Most important approach should be enhancing cities for citizens. No arrangement conducted should focus only tourists. Tourists will already come for the created positive local experience and be a part of the local life style.

* Designing participatory budgets and crowd funding are important methods. But support does not only appear financially. Important investments of a project also include space, man labor and time spared.

SESSION 2: Alternative tourism models for local development. Best practices of community based sustainable tourism.

Moderator: Ass. Prof. Dr. Alpay Tırıl (Sinop Uni.)

Participants: Christopher Hinteregger (Kohl & Partners)
Gökhan Menteş (Independent Consultant, Regional and Urban Planner)
Maurizio Davolio (European Alliance for Responsible Tourism and Hospitality– EARTH)
Ömer Faruk Boyacı (Small Hotels Association of Turkey, Chairman)

Reflections: Hikmet Tosun (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Advisory Board, Sinop City Culture and Tourism Manager)
Cemalettin Kaya (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board, Ayışığı Hotel)
Ali Yılmaz (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board, Antik Hotel)
Bedirhan Ayhan (Diyojen Hotel)

Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan(Bilgi Uni.)

Christopher Hinteregger [Kohl & Partners]:

Sinop should diversify the focus of its tourism strategies which are Culture and Nature based ecotourism, current sea tourism and attractive sightseeing locations in the city.

2030 Tourism Vision foresees an infrastructure with 8000 beds and 800.000 capacity accommodation. In order to reach this capacity, it is required to use Akliman Beach and forest for ecotourism. Besides, cheap flights for transportation (success of Krakow achieved as a cultural destination in Europe) and big, attractive investments (skywalk, observation terrace) are required for everyone to enjoy natural beauties.

In the SWOT analysis by Kohl and Partners Company made for Sinop, strengths include increasing interest of local tourists and local experiences like fishing, weaknesses include unattended forests and beaches and lack of routes assigned for tourist in most interesting locations.

8 main strategies are set for this purpose:

Creating a hub based in Sinop and Akliman beach

Transforming forests into a attraction point for ecotourism,

Making current touristic sights more attractive,

Creating new attractive locations in Sinop region,

Arranging human and financial resources to sustain marketing activities,

Intensification of marketing activities and branding,
Increasing number of budget flights,
Enhancing local perception and importance of tourism.
Action plans related to these strategies are prepared parallel to these
strategies and a common marketing perception as well as “clean
city” image is especially underlined.

***Gökhan Menteş [Independent Consultant, Regional and Urban
Planner]:***

Mardin Sustainable Tourism Project is an EU project in the framework
of Mardin Tourism Strategic Plan coordinated by Ministry
of Culture and Tourism, Ministry of Science, Industry and
Technology and Governorship.

10 year long tourism strategy and an action plan have been designed via
participatory work scenario approach.

Functional strategies include:

Protection Strategy

Branding, Product Development and Marketing Strategy

Quality Development Strategy and

Social Development Strategy.

Total of 47 projects are prepared in these fields including 1 governance,
17 protection, 26 branding, product development and marketing,
25 quality development and 5 social development projects.

All documents are accessible on mardinturizmprojesi.org for the project
which ended as of April 2015.

A value chain analysis had been conducted; positions of especially
hotels, souvenir shops, silversmiths in tourists’ experience of
Mardin are analyzed.

In the light of scenario analysis, 100% plan growth is foreseen and a
governance model has been designed accordingly.

Basic problem with the governance model is the ownership of the plan.

So its stakeholders question:

Who will manage/coordinate the plan and how,

Who will monitor its implementation,

Who will analyze its results and how,

Who will update the plan upon developments based on which criteria.
For technical support such as street restoration, the project was funded with € 9 million budget. Quality social investment owners collaborated with public and private sector in the region. Civil initiative and participatory institutional collaboration had been prioritized which all as strong elements established the sustainability of the project.

Maurizio Davolio [European Alliance for Responsible Tourism and Hospitality– EARTH]:

Earth - European Alliance for Responsible Tourism and Hospitality is an institution regulating some basic principles in Europe on responsible tourism. It takes responsible and competitive touristic activities into consideration while regulating all stakeholder relationships and regulates the field together with important actors of EU structure which are European Commission and Committee.

Its basic field of interest is to include local people into tourism via right based models and building sustainable structures. For example Olinda city of Brazil utilized World Heritage enlisted historical sites and a carnival free to public as well as mask and dance workshops organized parallel to the carnival to enable local people contribute into economy and thus differentiated itself from other traditional (i.e. Rio Carnival) experiences in terms of tourist experience. This trend is known as tourism of people/ turismo de gente.

Vivo Venetia is an initiative based on real experience in Venice region. <http://www.vivovenetia.com/en/> It includes an activity schedule for tourists in Venice which is a very intense cultural tourism destination seeing tourist as participants of many production processes (glass beads, lamps, masks etc) or experiences such as fishing with the local fishermen.

Briganti di Cerreto Coop in Valle dei Cavalieri region offer agriculture based experimental tourism alternatives as well as personally differentiating experiences such as weddings, artist studio visits,

participation in local plays, and participation at a local orchestra's rehearsal. Our expert diversified activities with different examples. So, <http://www.mygrantour.org/en/> , <http://www.innesto.org/> ; <http://naturavalp.it/> <http://liberaterre.it/en/> are examples in this field.

Finally our expert used the example of value chain and defined differentiated stages of souvenir shopping experience. It includes stages such as:

Buying a locally made souvenir from the shop

Buying it from the workshop it is made,

Buying it after watching its production, and getting informed on the production,

Buying something he/she made;

As mentioned in the above example, the personal connection built and related "product value" (spiritually and financially) will increase depending on how much tourists are included in different stages of the value chain.

Ömer Faruk Boyacı [Small Hotels Association of Turkey, Chairman]:

We need to pay attention to "Small Hotels" in line with value added investments and sustainable tourism criteria. In line with that approach, several steps were taken in Sirkeci by founding Development and Beautification of Sirkeci Association and 6 million YTL had been spent in 2010 for Kocapaşa restaurants.

A capacity of 5000 beds had been created in this area and the experience is differentiated with high standard boutique hotels. Accommodation style is linked to life style and budget of tourists; so we need to target people with higher purchasing power willing to have local experiences.

The tourism trend of 3 S (*sea, sun, sand*) is switched to E series (explore / education / experience / entertainment / excitement / enthusiasm / environment) as we became an information society. People now want to explore, learn, experience, be entertained, be excited, enjoy and be environment friendly.

We need to prioritize locality and development with the focus of

sustainability.

Public opinion leaders have to be pioneers in this field and share the importance of the matter with larger parts of the society as all values that you have sacrificed for tourists to come have direct impact on your sustainability.

Cappadocia, Alaçatı, Sirkeci are examples developed by respecting local elements and life style. It is not a strategic approach when local values and wetlands are sacrificed to build 5 star hotels.

Comments and Evaluation:

It is required to build connection between Sinop data base, master plan and cultural corridors.

Ethnography Museum, Balatlar Church, the coast, Kuruçeşme Street are corridors in the form of attraction centers.

Bed and breakfasts are developed values inherited by Sinop after a practice of living together with Americans for 50 years.

It is necessary to extend tourism into 12 months and attract conscious and participating tourists in different seasons with different activities. It is required to expand into new areas such as religion tourism-authentic rituals, water sports for that. For example foreign traveler would like to go fishing and experience that. Foreign tourists are neglected during summer season due to high demand of local tourists.

Besides the problems of businesses, there is the problem of human resource since there are no professionals. Vocational High Schools cannot overcome especially the language problem, service quality goes down but it causes an imbalance since price is high due to demand. If tourism can be extended into 12 months, no business will shut down during winter. For example Amasya succeeded doing that, they live on weekend tourism. Including 100 families into the process of bed and breakfast business may solve many problems here.

When we question whether there is a public negligence related to public projects on cultural and natural heritage projects or whether projects run slow, we found out about the 50 million YTL KTB support. It is essential to follow the investments.

Sinop on the other hand has "more value underneath than above it" since it is very lucky in terms of cultural heritage. Historical artifacts are to be protected in situ which causes problems in housing.

The solution of zoning can be provided with the support of additional floor support for those who open up spaces in lower levels for cultural heritage protection.

Creative services providing human element means more in small hotels.

SESSION 3: MANAGEMENT MODELS OF CULTURAL CENTERS TRIGGERING LOCAL DEVELOPMENT: BEST PRACTICES

Moderator: Ass. Prof. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan(Bilgi Uni.)

Participants: Dr. Ioannis Nasioulas (Aegean University, Greece, EU Consultant for Social Entrepreneurship)
Bingül Sezen Alış (Merzifon Amesia Coop)
Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours Association)

Reflections: Arthur Nadrinicinii (Social Economic Institute)
Semih Boyacı (Impact Hub Istanbul)
Ayşe Sabuncu (Impact Hub Istanbul)

Recorded by: Yiğit Bahadır Kaya (Sinop Sustainable Development Association)

Ioannis Nasioulas [Aegean University, Greece, EU Consultant for Social Entrepreneurship]:

Social entrepreneurship, social economy and social development concepts have common and differentiating aspects.

Social investments need to be more qualified. In order to increase the quality, investment resources have to be enriched, diversified and available resources need to be protected.

Social entrepreneurship stands right in between profit oriented businesses and non-profit civil society institutions.

Social businesses prefer to transfer their profits into fields such as health, transportation etc rather than distributing it to its stakeholders.

Competitive advantages also are effective in social entrepreneurship.

Conventional subventions should be swapped with social entrepreneurship.

Activities should be developed for Sinopale enabling them to be both local and international regional level to build bridges with neighboring countries.

* There is no legal regulation in Turkey on non-profit institutions. Legal regulation framework only covers cooperatives, foundations and civil society institutions. Social entrepreneurship have to be included in one of these then ***[Gökçe Dervişoğlu]***.

Bingül Sezen Alış (Merzifon Amesia Cooperative):

Amesia Cooperative is founded to let rural women be heard, enable

them to earn a living where they are born at, improve their handicrafts and prevent rural migration into the cities.

The project started with 15 women from mountain villages and reaches 120 people now. This success is due them working together as planned in full trust without questioning.

Ours is a cooperative based on collective work. It has succeeded to establish its own working and organizational system which are defined by participation of everyone working.

Besides the production of women in their homes, it has started to transform the idle spaces in villages. For example an old stone school in one of the villages is a now a functioning workshop.

This is successful as it does not have a large scale expectation in production in the future.

All work done is funded largely by the cooperative's own power and resources. Support by central or local administrations is limited. It is a significant example explaining the success achieved and freedom earned by our work when you can ask the Municipality or Governorship "Can we do something for you?" rather than demanding something.

Arzu Erturan [Street is Ours Association]:

We have started with the approach of active urbanity which can be achieved by enabling everyone especially in cities to be a part of the change.

Street Belongs to Us Once a Month activities held in Sinop by Street is Ours Association are good examples of changing cities with active urbanity approach. Streets are very important since they are public space and could be the basic points where urban change can emerge from.

Children deserve to be out on the street and that matters a lot to us.

People of Sinop can succeed in being a part of the change in their city.

Comments and Evaluation:

Arthur Nadrinicinii [Social Economic Institute]:

Social initiatives are truly important. They create great benefits especially in keeping people in rural areas.

Semih Boyacı (Impact Hub Istanbul):

Visibility of social entrepreneurship should be increased. It needs successful examples and them to be heard for that.

Social entrepreneurs and human resource should be brought together to meet.

Ayşe Sabuncu (Impact Hub Istanbul):

Many people in Turkey think social entrepreneurship is not the method to solve the problems of the country.

State investments rather focus on technological investments and initiatives which need to be shifted into social entrepreneurship.

* Lack of power can be strength. Areas with less investments could receive less investments maybe they are not known or there is no expertise. So investors in those fields will have fewer competitors. Civil society institutions can be used to guarantee that there is common and social interest in that field before starting a social investment *[Ioannis Nasioulas]*.

WORKSHOP 1: HOW CAN BUSINESS WORLD CONTRIBUTE TO THE BOTTOM UP LOCAL DEVELOPMENT OF A CITY?

Moderator: Lale Atat (European Cultural Association)

Participants: Yrd. Doç. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)
İbrahim Betil (Industrialist, Banker and Social Entrepreneur)
Öznur Akkaya (Bolu Philanthropists Foundation Secretary General)
Füsün Eczacıbaşı (SAHA Association, Board Chairwoman)

Recorded by: Elif Tepebaşı

Ass. Prof. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ):

She has stated the importance of local development for Sinop, the contribution of “HAL, Sinop Meeting Center” project in local development and background of “Culture and Education City” target:

Sinop has long been a part of different networks such as harbor cities, military cities but now left alone with its own potential. This city has the potential to lead local economy in Anatolian geography together with its educated population.

It created an expansion when Sinopale met the city as an international art activity. It also allowed the city to be a part of another international network through art. The goal should be initiate entrepreneurs and establish the city’s potential. HAL defines a natural shell and a meeting point for that.

HAL will be an incubation center with the support of civil society, academy and public but private sector leg is required for full project sustainability which is not defined yet. It is required to discuss the contribution of private sector. It has many layers and actors involved and therefore discussion needs to be together. It is required for private sector to be organized and orchestrated to provide support. Transfer of information is required more than monetary support.

İbrahim Betil [Industrialist, Banker and Social Entrepreneur]:

He stated the contribution and connection of social entrepreneurship initiatives to society based local development, social entrepreneurship and business world synergy in Turkey:

Civil society in Turkey is well behind. This task is undertaken by

foundations and associations.

Most important reason is lack of trust. Civil society needs to take tangible steps for transparency.

When we founded Society Volunteers Foundation, we determined that each local culture had very different needs. It is required not to dictate your own truths to the local and understand the needs of the local very well. Social responsibility projects are one of several important factors for private sector leaping brand value. The goal should be locally derived project development and authorizing youth for that creates the leap.

We work with this principle at our foundation. We started providing social services locally. We have more than 1200 projects annually with an approximately budget of 15 million YTL and receive support from approximately 2000-3000 institutions. You can find support easier if transparency and accountability are prioritized.

It is a condition that total support amount from our supporters cannot be higher than 7%. With this principle we built a sustainable support mechanism rather than a high amount received for once.

Another nice example for local needs is a project by Tülin Akin.

Observing local needs, Tülin Akin creates projects to meet the demand.

People in agriculture do not have financial knowledge other than the product they produce. Tülin Akin went to Vodafone to convince them to send prices of producers' products to each farmer's mobile. Later farmers subscribe to this service. 1.5 million farmers out of 3 million have subscribed.

Öznur Akkaya [Bolu Philanthropists Foundation Secretary General]:

She has explained Bolu Philanthropists model which embodies the concept of social investment as a first example of its kind, its relationship with the business world and the role Bolu Philanthropists Foundation in development of Bolu.

Philanthropist model is formed by the leaders of different districts of the city and different sectors together. Projects are supported by funds. The only criteria here is that projects should be nonprofit based.

Each year themes demanded by the local are considered and project call then is made. Funded areas are implemented in the borders of Bolu.

Philanthropists are businessmen of Bolu. There are protocols for support throughout the year. Being a foundations member is prestigious. Foundation does not have political connotations. Each year there is a grant project.

There are tax incentives abroad for the private sector to support social entrepreneurship. Such incentives create major advantages for philanthropists. We don't have such tax regulations yet in our country.

Füsun Eczacıbaşı [SAHA Association President]:

She mentioned the reason of existence and basis for SAHA Association founded as non-profit civil society institution to support contemporary art, as well as motivations of its corporate and individual supporters:

Contemporary art is something that is possible thanks to means of the individuals in Turkey. Public support provided in the world is very limited in our country. There is a search for support in contemporary art. Artists can not develop projects the way they would like to.

How to do it?

- There should be no crushing under any philanthropist or sponsor.
- Professionals should decide which project to support.
- Organizations apply SAHA not the artists themselves. It allows the artists to stay independent when they don't personally apply. Support is provided to the institution that employs the artist not the individual artist.
- SAHA has a structure avoiding manipulation.
- SAHA does not have ownership.
- SAHA has collective benefits and co-ownership.
- SAHA allows individuals to reach sources they cannot otherwise reach individually.

Comments and Evaluation:

- ☐ Does the association only support Bolu projects through businessmen of Bolu?
Yes. We aim to increase the number of philanthropists [*Öznur Akkaya*].
- ☐ Should “foundation” model be preferred or “association” model in Turkey?
You need main assets for a foundation in the form of real estate or cash. The number of founders for a foundation [board of trustees] cannot be increased later. Foundation is more bureaucratic and it does not have subscription fees.
Association functions with the principle of memberships. They function faster. The number of members may increase. You charge subscription fees. It has a more democratic structure. It has a more flexible functioning structure [*İbrahim Betil*].
- ☐ Does private sector have demands for tax advantages? Would they like to contribute to civil society?
It raises the brand value of institutions when they support such projects. The consumer’ decision to purchase is affected when they hear that income from the product sales will be transferred to a social project. The motivation for institution staff then is not limited to earning money and their loyalty increases since they feel they have contributed to public [*İbrahim Betil*].
It is very important to submit a certificate of appreciation to those who supported which motivates them and allow their contribution to be visible [*İbrahim Betil*].
- ☐ Which sentence should we use for the business world to support projects in Sinop?
I suggest you ask this to a group of Sinopians when you bring them together [*İbrahim Betil*].

Comments by businessmen of Sinop:

- ☐ Businessmen in Sinop conduct social responsibility projects individually.
- ☐ There is a problem in Sinop in tourism sector for qualified labor. Educated, bilingual staff is missing.
- ☐ Since tourism in Sinop is limited to 3 months, it is difficult for tourism entrepreneurs during winters threatening sustainability of this business. Many tourism entrepreneurs can continue to survive during winter months by doing other jobs.

JANUARY 14, 2016, Thursday, Istanbul
“Spatial Actions for Urban Development”

SESSION 1: MANAGEMENT MODELS OF CULTURAL CENTERS TRIGGERING LOCAL DEVELOPMENT: BEST PRACTICES

Moderator: Vasif Kortun (SALT Research and Programs Director)
Participants: Rarita Zbranca (Altart Foundation, Fabrica di Pensula)
Christian Potiron (European Capital of Culture– Pilsen 2015)
Katarina Slukan (Bunker)
Veton Nurkollari (Dokufest)
Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Doç. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan (Bilgi Uni.)

Vasif Kortun [SALT Research and Programs Director]:

Cities left aside or in the background not being the cultural destination of their own countries primarily suffered a lot from this lack of attention. We will hear about examples that managed to exist that are not located in main corridors or not put in to the attention of public through administrative power and managed to exist without being the shadow of such cities.

Rarita Zbranca [Altart Foundation, Fabrica di Pensula]:

Fabrica de Pensule is an initiative in Cluj to bring artists, different artists' initiatives / federation together in an abandoned paint factory that has taken important steps in the process of developing local culture policies. Thanks to this initiative, Cluj vity became one of 12 cities that emerge in contemporary art.

The structure includes an example of social kitchen that follows responsible tourism examples to improve social capital and human resources and buys from the local farmers. This kitchen serves the homeless and creates awareness for farmers in this social environment.

Pata- Cluj initiative works to allow locally resident Roma people to protect their cultural values and be accepted by the locals around them with tolerance.

New models are included in the initiative such as the open academy triggering social creativity. The candidacy of Cluj- Napoca for 2021 European Capital of Culture (ECC) is managed by Urban

Lab through participatory funds and budget. Cluj Makers / Techshops mobilize the economy of change that works free on charge basis by sharing information on reuse, upcycling.

House of Permanent Culture Public uses a special administrative model by providing artists with free space to enable them socializing through activities such as baking bread and beer making.

In all of the activities mentioned above, culture functions as a special force especially in transforming disadvantaged groups.

If we need to come up with a suggestion for Sinop from here, we can suggest hybrid management models for Historical Prison and HAL. The factory mentioned above has approximately € 20.000 monthly fixed expenses and it is not realistic that it is funded by any given institution.

To reduce such burden of a budget, programs with significant content for the spectator or venues provided by public institutions can be utilized. Besides, important artists can call for to support these collective structures to create visibility. Values and especially working principles need to be clear from the beginning. It will be facilitating to have a horizontal decision mechanism a small operation.

The model should definitely feed on local values and phenomenon and be authentic. We have used models like crowd-funding. It is beneficial to follow similar examples abroad and keep your contacts active.

Vasif Kortun: How does the governance structure function exactly?

Governance has a federative structure. People in artists residence programs are also included in the decision making process during their stay. There are 3 full time employees.

The mission of the structure is to obtain a critical point of view for cultural policies. Different civil society representation emerges in disguise in the post neoliberal policies phase. NGO's are not the only representatives. University is also an important institution triggering intellectual energy. Actors approved by locals are effective in developing local cultural policies. In the example of Cluj, ¼ of the 400.000 population consists of university students

and we see that not just public authority but private sector and civil initiative are effective in decision making in an environment where there are more young people. The transformative effect of this structure will become more visible in the next two years.

Christian Potiron [European Capital of Culture – Pilsen 2015]:

This presentation focuses on the impact of ECC's on small cities of Eastern Europe in the examples of Kosice 2013 and Pilsen 2015. Site links are www.kosice2013.sk , www.plzen2015.cz.

Civil society and private sector have been involved in ECC activities as a result of long time discussions. Contrary to ECC activities held in major cities, there is a chance to shape cultural policies in small cities through the ECC momentum.

SPOT Project: www.spots.sk <http://vymenniky.sk/>

In Vymenninky, the city of workers public space management experience include public activities with hot blocks, creating a sense of belonging, microloan supported cultural and art projects.

This collaboration had been successful in public oriented programming, public space utilization, artist residence programs, art education, interdisciplinary art education and artistic production practices involving locals.

Cultural dialogue is created with projects such as aesthetic production with graffiti in suburban areas, multicultural soup – intergeneration art project, Roma festival.

Dutch initiative CAL XL Labortorium Voor Kunst Smenleving modeled such efforts which has basic features as civil demand, artists response, co-creation in line with the new values established. <http://www.cal-xl.nl/laboratorium/>

In Pilsen such progressive examples in co-creation increased the number of collective production spaces (such as maker space) and design stores which became sustainable elements after ECC process.

Virtually created applications allowed virtual city tours with 7 different guides (different age, education, world's view, hobbies) referencing Pilsen hospitality. Guided tours were held in neighborhoods, Pilsen family album was created with an exhibition for this

album.

In terms of governance, abandoned train stations were transformed into cultural centers and a mixed group of spectators interested in different disciplines were allowed to have access to culture as a democratic method.

Katarina Slukan [Bunker]: <http://www.bunker.si/eng/about-bunker>

Example of Bunker from Slovenia is an initiative located in a transformed power plant since 2004 displaying a critical artist's view. Performance and performing arts activities are held in this space using innovative methods.

Chorus of Complaints is one of these activities. The museum initiative had been idle for 10 years and many managers were assigned in that time.

2009 Sostenuto project <http://www.bunker.si/eng/sostenuto-projects-and-activities-2009-%E2%80%93-2010> includes modules developed for the space on belonging, lost identity.

Using parking lot space, Park Tabor has references on possessing and different use of public space of cultural region sampling Museum Quarter Wien. Thus initiative believes transformation will occur through social and cultural progression turns the medium into a live and participatory.

Veton Nurkollari [Dokufest]: <http://dokufest.com/2015/>

Dokufest is a documentary and film festival in Kosovo growing by increasing its number of spectators in high rates all by itself. In 2012 with 8.500 spectators, festival in 2015 had gone beyond 15.000 spectators. Governments supported the importance of such cultural activities during the election period.

When a public space that had problems with the municipality was opened for the culture spectators, they city benefited from that too. Journalists who are experts in tourism, city guides and bloggers were called for to develop the city. Thus grant support was ensured.

Doculab that started thanks to the festival works together with Ministry

of Education and local schools on human rights education and it involves a selection of movies focusing on this issue. So far 3.000 students have participated in screenings.

During the festival photography exhibitions, concerts are organized and activity program is extended to cover a longer period of time as well as opening several cultural heritage sites (like the Turkish bath) to the use of culture and arts again. All year around screenings take place with Dokukino in the movie theatre. With 150 volunteers, the city is really transformed for 9 days to create a great energy and attention.

WORKSHOP 1: HOW SHOULD THE HISTORICAL PRISON GET FUNCTIONALIZED AND MANAGED?

Moderator: Vasıf Kortun (SALT Research and Programs Director)

Participants: Ali Emrah Ünlü (EMN Architecture)

Reflections: Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)
Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale Arts Director, MSGSÜ)
Hasan Onur (Founder of Sinop History and Cultural Researches Association)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu (Bilgi Uni.)

Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan (Bilgi Uni.)

Ali Emrah Ünlü [EMN Architecture]:

Ali Emrah Ünlü told about the Sinop Historical Prison and Shipyard Project and started his speech with the presentation titled

“Shining Star of North”: <http://www.sinop-art.eu/>

Macro environment and urban scale management plan also are important as well as the micro presentation involving the prison.

This project has 3 phases:

1. Prison + Urban Management + Tourism Plan
2. Harmonization with EU Acquis
3. Similar cultural heritage -restoration projects in Turkey – practices of reutilization development experience

It is essential to develop this process with participation. Currently the entrance to a limited area within the Prison is available with tickets. The only area ticketed will be the building located in the covered area.

Memories of people who have resided in the Prison are embedded in the soul of the space.

It will be accessible to all.

Ironic situations occurred when the venue was re-functioned such as transforming the juvenile hall into children playground.

It is planned to open the north –south axis.

It is planned to start a Entrepreneur’s Hub.

The middle section of the structure divided into 3 will be an indoor space for 400-450 people.

It is planned to be a multi disciplinary cultural center.

Buildings adjacent to the old city walls will be removed so that connection to the shore can be established and a market place will be opened in between the revealed towers.

It is planned to build two towers outside the old city walls using old drawings. One will be a café-bistro. Towers will be demountable to be mobile.

Toilets will be located outside the building to be portable.

The boat yard will keep its function but it is planned for improvement in it.

Exemplary restoration project is Fener Balat cultural center which was not sustainable but used by Fatih Municipality.

It is important who will be operating it and decision needs to be a common one.

Project has a budget of € 10 Million.

Comments and Evaluation:

Mahir Namur [European Cultural Association Secretary General]:

High budgets are spent inefficiently in development projects that I have been in during the time I worked as an engineer since sustainability and end user were never been major concerns.

We built a participatory process here and have been working with locals for 4-5 years so that this structure can be functionalized.

We trust the young generation at Sinop Sustainable Development Association to follow up.

Melih Görgün [European Cultural Association, Sinopale Arts Director, MSGSÜ]:

First the content and design of the project should be done but it has not been done like that. First the architectural design was made and later [now] there is an attempt to create content. Museums Quartier example is valuable but the participatory process here that had already started was not taken into contribution to your design process.

Hasan Onur [Founder of Sinop History and Cultural Researches Association]:

We received the space in 2000 from the Ministry of Justice, Provincial Special Administration claimed it in 2004. They said it will be a hotel and we wanted to use it as a space for culture and worked with Sinopale team that was an initiative for this issue. The communication between parties ended for the last year when your project started.

This is an EU project and it was open to all kinds of communication and contribution at all stages [*Ali Emrah Ünlü*].

Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan[Bilgi Uni.]:

ECOC projects were presented in the morning. We have taken Istanbul 2010 under public authority which was shared with civil initiative and there needs to be a lesson learnt from this experience. Civil initiative continues to provide its support here. The work that you have established in tangible form cannot be sustainable if it is not filled with value and approach/content. This initiative here needs support in leadership.

WORKSHOP 2: URBAN PLANNING FOR SİNOP

Moderator: Gökhan Menteş (Independent Consultant, Urban and Regional Planner)

Participants: Prof. Dr. Christoph Luchsinger (Vienna University of Technology)

Ass. Prof. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Ass. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ (MSGSÜ)

Reflections: Ali Yılmaz (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board, Antik Otel)

Hikmet Tosun (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Consultary Board, Sinop City Culture and Tourism Manager)

Gün Önen (Architect)

Prof. Dr. Aziz Konukman (Gazi Uni.)

Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)

Gökhan Menteş (Independent Consultant, Urban and Regional Planner)

Recorded by: Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours)

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna University of Technology]:

He has stated that their work included Area Management Plan in Sinop and Sinop Master Plan as well as two workshops held with students in Sinop one in March and one in May:

Most basic elements of Sinop are defined as stones, water, hills, hilltops, wooden structure and green areas. It is required to reveal the old Sinop city structure that disappeared. It is essential to reveal the walls of Castle/Citadel.

There needs to be a urban sprawl in Sinop towards land which would be west.

Sinop is divided into 7 areas: 1 is the area where the university and airport are, 2 the area all the way to the entrance of the old city, 3 citadel/castle, 4 city center, 5 area between the city centre and island, 6 island area.

Western part of the city can be denser and green on the island can be transferred to the city center.

The settlement area within the city walls can be handled separately.

Suggestions are made for the area of Atatürk Street and Clock Tower.

There are different suggestions of different scales for the area around Shipyard, Yalı Kahvesi, shoreline and Aşıklar Street area: Sea Park on the area near the Castle etc.

The city entrance needs rearrangement.

Northern walls and area around it should be rearranged to be public.

A tool box as an urban catalyst for transformation includes tool boxes and packages for point solutions such as parking lot, garbage. Different action plans are devised under the Master Plan. Consequently the plan determines an approach in three different scales such as development areas, the crust, and the tool box.

Bahar Aksel Enşici [MSGGSÜ]:

Creative Industries Center work on local economic development and its relationship with creative industries. She mentioned the Summer School and Seminar in Sinop held in this context:

We worked on issues of public space, creative industries and tourism.

We studied Sinop in horizontal level rather than vertically for culture-creative industries, tourism and public space. Public spaces are an essential title connecting these two other subjects to each other. We had analysis of several titles such as tourism, handicrafts, fishing, NGO's, educational structure etc.

It is possible to think of local development in the city and its realization through public spaces. Sinop is equipped with urban equipments such as public spaces open to public, cultural outfits and HAL building, educational buildings etc.

We searched for the city's identity with people of Sinop which has been our biggest luck. The basic duty of planning is to understand the city through the eyes of people of Sinop.

We learnt that the city's backbone is Sakarya Street, most important identity element is Historical Prison, and most socialized area is the shoreline and teagardens thanks to this participatory workshop. It creates data for planning when you try to understand Sinop through daily life.

Tourism Master Plan, Municipal projects, Area Management Plan, Implementary Development Plan etc are totally detached from each other. There is a lack of coordination and integration which causes a lot of problems in implementation.

Kevser Üstündağ [MSGGSÜ]:

She made her presentation via the question "Can Sinop be a model for

planning?":

Sinop taught us a lot such as how to work interactive, physical planning is not sufficient on its own, how important it is to work with other people. We have seen that analysis only is not enough. Our collective work became outside the box.

We were in a collective not individual creativity.

We worked with those who were involved in the solution; we listened to each other, discussed, trusted each other and came up with solutions discovering common problems.

We came together through networks; we turned our creative solutions into reality.

A space was created for collective solution creation which is a beginning. Our goal is not to go up on stage but build and create it.

Thank you all for being a part of transformation through the connection of art-culture and city. Past values are essential in connectivity. We are all here to own Sinop's future.

Comments and Evaluation:

Ali Yılmaz [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board, Antik Hotel]:

The actual crime lies in different approach and mentality. Sinop became badly built due to the master development plan. There has not been any intention to ask public, NGO's, experts on their opinion. Municipality develops a Master Development Plan but we don't know a thing about it. Even as members of Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board , we are not informed about the plan.

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna University of Technology]:

We have sent everything to everyone, we have tried to build open communication and shared what we have done but we did not get feedback. This Sinopale Forum brought us together here in person which is very important. I would like to thank the organizers for it.

This is not a top down project. I believe the process will start today. We can make new start by bringing two workshops done with students together.

Hikmet Tosun [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Advisory Board, Sinop City Culture and Tourism Manager]:

We share all data requested from our institution when Sinop Prison and Area Management Plan was being prepared but they never came back to meet Area Management team later during the time when project was prepared.

Gün Önen [Architect]:

All actors are here. It will be possible to switch to social planning from physical planning with these actors.

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna University of Technology]:

I have suspicions on building a large scale marina in Sinop.

Aziz Konukman (Gazi Uni.):

What did Sinop decide on? Is there any concern for nuclear in Sinop Area Management? Nuclear issues not only inherent to Sinop but it is national even international.

Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General):

I see that there has been a communication problem here. We have to be solution oriented. We need to solve the communication problem that occurred despite everyone's goodwill. How can we transform into good communication?

Gökhan Menteş (Independent Consultant, Urban and Regional Planner):

Planning today is not possible without governance. Planning is not possible if it is not multiparty involved and not based on sustainability. All this happens since public is not equally involved in the process. All stakeholders should have been included in the planning process and there should have been a group to follow up the implementation. We don't have a control/audit mechanism. I suggest that civil structure that became a symbol through Sinopale should come up with that mechanism.

SESSION: EVALUATION OF ISTANBUL FORUM

Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General):

We have talked about the role of NGO's and culture in urban development and got good results. We said there should be good communication between the private sector, civil society, public sector and university.

Businessmen took part in these meetings for the first time.

Of course there will be problems in collaboration. We need to be realistic. Communication will improve if we can get positive results from conflicts. We can't have progress if we are left to conflicts and we need to look ahead for our future goals and actions.

It was essential that experts participated.

Urban dwellers first should learn participation. How are we going to communicate together, how can we benefit from these projects and how can we do it altogether? We need to take small steps first. What will be our first steps? We know how to live well. We need to build the concept of co-creation and co-exist all together and we need to think.

First let's build HAL, ask for help, and build our steps. I suggest building all that when we go to Sinop.

Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGÜ):

What do we expect? We need to know that we expect long term feedback for the future but this will not be fast. The benefits of cultural investments in cities and society become effective in the longer term. Knowing that, we have to take actions and plan expectations accordingly.

It is more important as a goal to transform the city not into a tourist city but a city where residents can live happily obtaining a good quality of life. When you achieve this, tourism will come on its own. We can start with small but effective applications besides large projects in order to achieve all that improvement.

January 15, 2016, Friday, Sinop
“Summary of Istanbul Forum”

OPENING REMARKS

Participants: Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale, MSGSÜ)
Dr. Yasemin Özata Çetinkaya (Governor of Sinop)
Baki Ergül (Mayor of Sinop)
Dr. Ioannis Nasioulas (Aegean University Greece, EU Social Entrepreneurship Consultant)
Bingül Sezen Alış (Merzifon Amesia Cooperative)
Maurizio Davolio (European Responsible Tourism and Hospitality Association– EARTH)
Prof. Dr. Christoph Luchsinger (Vienna Technology University)

Reflections: Esin Ünlüat Kurdoğlu
Alp Arısoy (Urban Studies Coordinator/ÇEKÜL Foundation)
Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan(Bilgi Uni.)
Branca Neves (Lisbon Municipality)

Recorded by: Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours Association)

Opening Remarks:

In his opening remarks Melih Görgün explained the purpose of the forum and theme. He mentioned that culture is the leading feature that will differentiate Sinop from others.

Mayor Baki Ergül mentioned that Sinopale held in Sinop following Forum in Istanbul made major contributions to the city and carried the city into the international platform.

Governor Yasemin Özata Çetinkaya mentioned that she participated in the Forum in Istanbul which was very fruitful and stated that Sinopale that she heard of but never participated was really a valuable activity.

***Ioannis Nasioulas [Aegean University Greece, EU Social
Entrepreneurship Consultant]:***

He started his speech mentioning the concept of social entrepreneurship and social economy:

We can consider the concept of social economy to the interface of private sector/economy and public economy. Social economy which can be also defined as achieving public goals using private sector mostly is implemented by NGO's, cooperatives, associations and social entrepreneurs. Social entrepreneurs are is anew factor among others.

Social entrepreneurship stands in the middle of the scale which

has NGOs on one end and economic entrepreneurs on the other. Funding, visibility and regulations are essential in social entrepreneurship. EU funds such as Horizon 2020, Erasmus+, DG Programmes, Interreg Programmes and Instrument for Pre-accession can be utilized as a tool to solve economic problems in social entrepreneurship.

Bingül Sezen Alış [Merzifon Amesia Cooperative]:

A retired teacher, Miss Bingül mentioned after her retirement her path coincided with women in the rural area from 15 villages who are all producers when she was in a search to share her savings. She mentioned her experience in the project started 5 years ago on volunteer basis with 15 leader women after they met:

We had lots of problems, we struggled seriously but we succeeded working as planned with the principle of unity, integrity and equality.

- First phase: Branding journey with women who are economically liberated in agriculture sector.
- Second phase: The process of earning social security for women who work like bees.
- Third phase: Adding European lines into Merzifon woven.

The feeling of “We can do something” became strong and we have discovered that working in collaboration is a way of becoming a cooperative. It is apparent in patriarchal family structures and we learnt that women can earn a living for their households, how to stand inequalities and women have rights too.

Goal in becoming a cooperative was to provide products from the producer to the consumer, from field to your table, from rural to the city. In 2015 women demanded to become a cooperative with their free will and Amesia brand name was born.

They saw their own clothing and they set their own rules. We prioritize being reliable and we have principles.

We converted two abandoned primary schools into workshops. We are working on new ones.

Our country needs people who read, produce, create and work. Our road

was tough to conquer but our goals are clear. As a result of all that we were elected to be most successful women's cooperative. There are women all around our country who can achieve this successful cooperative model. It is essential to support rural women for success. We are ready to share all of our knowledge and experience on the matter.

Maurizio Davolio (European Responsible Tourism and Hospitality Association – EARTH):

He explained the concept of responsible tourism:

Responsible tourism is a type of tourism with social and economic equality and respectful to environment and culture.

We have founded EARTH (European Alliance for Responsible Tourism and Hospitality) platform and many international association / institution became members of it.

Society based tourism is a type of responsible tourism which is for the society, together with the society and involving society. It usually covers rural and local areas and less common in cities.

As in the example of Olinda from Brazil by one of the member organizations of the platform and I Briganti di Cerreto and Valle dei Cavalieri, it is possible provide opportunities for tourism by improving local values by protecting them, restoring buildings, creating attraction by running ecological tours locally etc.

Experience tourism is also very important in that matter. Experiencing local cultures, collect fruit from the trees, take part in local weddings, staying in authentic rural venues is a way of responsible tourism as it is based on tourism of experience and emotions.

There is an example of souvenir shop. You make your own souvenir.

What increases the value of souvenirs? Is it a product sold in a shop or a product that you took part in its production or product that you have produced yourself?

We would be happy to have Sinop as our member if a society based tourism method is implemented. Our tour guides are willing to help and support Sinop.

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna Technology University]:

He mentioned that his role in Sinop project was considerably smaller than Wehdorn Office:

We hope the project can be open to discussion by everyone's involvement.

We realized everyone is doing something different when we started asking who is doing what. We have to talk about it all and discuss it. We hope to achieve that until spring.

We would like to invite everyone in these discussions; we hope that everyone can contribute to achieve results all together. In order to keep this going and make it real, we need to keep our dialogue alive when the project is over. This is an open invitation.

Comments and Evaluation:

- How can the negative perception of becoming a cooperative be eliminated?
Becoming a cooperative became a trendy topic again. This concept perceived to be an old fashioned one emerges as a solution again today in social economy. It is advantage that no big brands exist in Sinop, so Sinop has a big potential to start cooperatives in terms of social entrepreneurship [*Esin Ünlüat Kurdoğlu*].
- What are the advantages of starting a cooperative?
They are not forced to compete with big brands because they are more advantageous in economic development than the women working for those big brands [*Alp Arısoy*]. Thanks to the possibilities of technology today, you can do internet sales and local producers have more advantage since it needs no intermediaries in sales [*Mahir Namur*].
- What should be done for social entrepreneurship?
Cooperatives are more advantageous since they have a more flexible production method. It is very important and effective to provide education for social cooperatives to be founded. [*Ioannis Nasioulas*].
There is no definition for nonprofit companies in Turkish Commercial Law. We try to come up with creative solutions based on the existing infrastructure. Besides that, there is new pressure and work to improve the current legislation. TÜSEV started working on this issue together with associations, foundations and cooperatives. We are ready to provide creative social entrepreneurship together with Mr Mahir at HAL, Sinop Meeting Center [*Gökçe Dervişoğlu*].
- The example of Özgür Kazova [Free Kazova] was mentioned [*Esin Ünlüat Kurdoğlu*].
- We are talking about a society that wishes to have progress in terms of creativity, participation, social entrepreneurship... Examples of different scales such as Unesco Creative Cities network or Lisbon can be transferred to small cities too. There are different examples from Portugal such as city of music, medieval city, and city of literature which are successful cities with different themes and visions. It is not difficult to organize festivals and to set a goal; it only requires believing and deciding. For example it is a very important feature that

food in Sinop is grown non toxic. We all have the power to contribute to that. I hope Sinop can achieve that too but will not be spoiled because it is necessary to keep the balance at tourism [*Branca Neves*].

SESSION 1: SUMMARY OF ISTANBUL FORUM

Participants: Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)
Prof. Dr. Aziz Konukman (Gazi Uni.)
Cansu Kırcan (Sinop Sustainable Development Association)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Gökçe Dervişoğlu (Bilgi Uni.)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ (MSGSÜ)
Yeşim Dizdaroğlu (ÇEKÜL)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Alpay Tırlı (Sinop Uni.)
Alp Arısoy (Urban Studies Coordinator/ÇEKÜL Foundation)
Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)
Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale, MSGSÜ)

Recorded by: Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours Association)

Bahar Aksel Enşici [MSGSÜ]:

Purpose of the forum was to enable all different individuals and institutions putting effort for Sinop to be aware of each other, listen to and share other experiences in order to do better with the desired deeds in the future.

Aziz Konukman [Gazi Uni.]:

My expectation was to build the relationship on how to embody Sinop branch of KUZKA's regional plan and share experiences of our foreign guests.

Cansu Kırcan [Sinop Sustainable Development Association]:

During the Forum, we have seen that the required collaboration of public, private sector, civil society and university for sustainable development can be achieved in Sinop.

Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan[Bilgi Uni.]:

I believe that interdisciplinary experience of 10 years attained at Sinopale will contribute in HAL, Sinop Meeting Centre. We are all stakeholders and we all claim. Physical constitutions are not sufficient and they need to be filled in. Forum was interdisciplinary and everyone was convinced that this content was created in the form of layers.

Kevser Üstündağ [MSGŞÜ]:

What were we doing 10 years ago, where are we now 10 years later, where will be in 10 years? It was our goal to talk about all that. We have seen the success of being connected to each other with a network for Sinop like a fish net. We need to keep on listening to each other, talking about conflicts and dreaming.

Yeşim Dizdaroğlu [ÇEKÜL]:

My parents were physicians so I grew up with the idea of healing. I am here since Sinop was one of the things that made me who I am. What you need is individuals and sense of belonging for culture to exist. Culture is something that we build on nature. It is not possible for the city to breathe if we don't allow culture to exist. I believe that this forum is a chance to share with each other and do collective work. We need to read the city of Sinop very well. We need to move on the axis of collaboration. Boutique and durable city concepts are trendier rather than a brand city. We are here to build mechanisms to establish common sense while protecting our values.

Alpay Tırıl [Sinop Uni.]:

Sinop has a city with a soul but has been negatively influenced by the urbanization process in the country. We have to learn and teach not to harm first which was one of the goals of the Forum. Another goal was to stop other interventions in Sinop from now on and show that it is owned.

Alp Arısoy [Urban Studies Coordinator/ÇEKÜL Foundation]:

There is always a locomotive engine stakeholder in revival of cities such as public, private sector etc but civil initiative is fundamental in sustainability. Sinop is a striking example in this regard and is strong since it continues to work for years now. Secondly the approach is holistic and constructive. Problems were discussed 5 years ago whereas solutions are discussed now which is a significant progress. This is followed by discussing

implementation son the way which was an important purpose of the Forum.

T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale, MSGSÜ):

The purpose of the Forum was to discuss what we can build on the experience we brought from our past and obtained through Sinopale and think what we can do in collectivity with our common sense.

Gökçe Dervişoğlu Okandan(Bilgi Uni.):

It was motivating that Mayor and Governor came to the Forum. We need to support the decision makers so that they can act by considering the information and thoughts discussed and recorded here.

Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General):

We aimed to bring different actors of the city together through their different roles by holding discussions here. It is important to ask what I can do.

JANUARY 16, 2016, Saturday, Sinop
“Local Economic Development Models”

SESSION I: SINOP IN DEVELOPMENT I

Moderator: Prof. T. Melih Görgün (European Cultural Association, Sinopale Art Director, MSGSÜ)

Participants: Prof. Dr. Christoph Luchsinger (Vienna Technology University)

Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Cansu Kırca (Sinop Sustainable Development Association)

Mahir Namur (European Cultural Association Secretary General)

Cemalettin Kaya (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Advisory Board, Ayışığı Hotel)

Ali Yılmaz (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Advisory Board, Antik Hotel)

Hikmet Tosun (Sinop C Cultural Heritage Area Management Advisory Board, Sinop City Culture and Tourism Manager)

Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Alpay Tırıl (Sinop Uni.)

Christoph Luchsinger [Vienna Technology University]:

Luchsinger explained the architectural project since Wehdorn could not come to the meeting:

Sinop has a wild growth. The city has grown vertically and horizontally which used to have two storey buildings in the past. The purpose of the project is to make the old city fabric more visible.

The project has three sections as in small working area, Historical Prison and environs, inner citadel.

The dockyard area in front of the castle is problematic. There needs to be at least some intervention. Sinop's growth should be towards the west.

The area in front of Eastern City Walls including the market space and schools goes towards the southern shore which needs to be opened and converted into an uninterrupted space.

You see a large tent in the harbor which has buildings underneath it.

Small fishermen boats will stay in the harbor which will also be a marina. A new marina can be added too. Another marina can be built next to sailing club. There can be a small shipyard and water park in that area too. Water and green areas should be following each other in a cycle.

Some buildings need to be removed to create visibility for Southern

City Walls. Old stones should be made visible. Pocket spaces should be created in the western wing which needs to have an archaeological dig in it. The alloy made by interventions from different periods should be made visible.

We have divided Sinop into seven areas. First is the Sinop airport, university and bus station area. We have divided the city into sections starting from here into the city.

Now I will present Prof. Wehdorn's work:

Wehdorn worked on many historical buildings. One of the most important examples is the Vienna's Museums Quartier as well as palaces and gastronomic sites.

Most important issue is the participation of individuals.

Prison is through to become a cultural center. What matters is that it should be accessible, functional and create employment possibilities.

The prison should be integrated with the city landscape. Tourism should change its agenda and embrace a supporting role in all activities.

The old building in the project is functionally divided into three sections.

- First section is reserved to be a café and shopping mall.
- Mid section is reserved for an activity area.
- Third section is left to become a museum.

Juvenile hall is reserved to be a venue for children activities.

New buildings will be reserved for administrative and cultural use. There will be a corridor opened here and there will be sales stands here.

Did you collaborate with other institutions while preparing the city master plan? What is the relation between the Municipal plan and the plan you prepared? *[T. Melih Görgün]*

I can't answer that in simple terms. We have been to Sinop a couple of times. We tried to open up a dialogue here which did not happen until now but we want it to work from now on. I don't have information on other plans but we would like to know.

It is an important problem that Sinop lacks dialogue. Everyone should be informed about each other. I wish they have worked together

with Governor's office and Municipality since the beginning of their planning work. What do you think of pedestrianization of Sakarya Street? [*T. Melih Görgün*]

There are different suggestions for traffic solutions in Sinop. I don't agree with all of them. Vehicle density should be taken out of the city during high season. So we have placed a large parking lot in the western city entrance. We suggested having an indoor parking lot there too. Traffic should be moving without any sidewalks as well. That is my suggestion. Sidewalks on Sakarya Street should be removed.

Planning of Sinop will continue after this project for me. We built high building concept in Vienna. We asked everyone about their opinion. The geographic distance between Vienna and Sinop is also a problem which affected the dialogue too. There can be exchange of opinions using the web site.

Did you consider the fact that Sinop has no traffic lights? [*T. Melih Görgün*]

Traffic culture is also changing. In 1950's traffic lights were common. In 60's underpass for pedestrians was a popular idea. Not popular idea is that traffic should be shared among vehicles and pedestrians. I believe traffic should run according to its own course.

Bahar Aksel Enşici [MSGGSÜ]:

We have working on Sinop since 2012. Since ours is a research project we don't have a result that is converted into a project totally or spatial suggestions.

As a research project ours was a different approach and we held a three stage study on areas of culture, tourism and public.

After our study in Istanbul, we stayed in Sinop with a group of approximately 40 students.

Public space is essential. But makes public space important is surrounding functions. If the surrounding functions are not well public space will be negatively affected.

Sinop stand out with its tolerance functional diversity. It has equipment

that is not common in a city of this scale:

We have handled outdoor public spaces in three groups of squares, shoreline and parks.

Its cultural assets include Sinop Prison, Archeology Museum, Ethnography Museum, Ice House, Rıza Nur Library, Pervane Medrassah.

Other urban functionalities include education buildings, Hal building, commercial and city center.

Sinop is very advantageous in terms of civil society institutions.

We ran a urban identity study asking questions such as what do you like in Sinop, what do you not like in Sinop, what comes to your mind when we say Sinop, where would you have your guests, where do you not take your guests. The results are marked on a map.

Sinop people live more horizontally. There are outdoor public spaces connecting these places to each other. There should be a holistic planning about these places rather than individual projects. All works done should be brought together.

Cansu Kırcan [Sinop Sustainable Development Association]:

Cansu Kırcan explained the functional transformation process of HAL which is a building from 1950's in Sinop in her presentation titled "HAL, Sinop Meeting Center Project" on behalf of Sinop Sustainable Development Association:

This building has been used as a wholesale market hall for fruit and vegetables and it was donated by Muharrem Tansel to be used for Sinop's benefit to the Municipality.

It has lost its function today. The building hosts some merchants such as a grocery store, butcher, and tailor as well some civil society organizations, a sculpture artist and shops used by the municipality. It has become less used in time.

HAL building became important again as Sinopale claimed it. Sinopale started to work to transform this place into "HAL, Sinop Meeting Center" together with Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts, Street Belongs To Us Association (Sokak Bizim Derneği) and

many local civil society organizations.

HAL building is being transformed into a space with a new function to serve the goal to make Sinop “A City of Training and Culture” for “Culture Based Sustainable Development”.

In order to attain the goal of sustainable development, it is required for civil society, public, universities and private sector to work in collaboration with each other. HAL is the meeting space for these actors in Sinop.

HAL Meeting Center consists of units which are administered and coordinated by Sinop Sustainable Development Association. Other units include Media Center, Sinopale, Social Entrepreneurship Platform, Training Center, Design Center and Center for Urban Memory and Researches.

All units work in collaboration with each other to start social initiatives such as:

- Society Based Tourism Network:

It aims to build a society based tourism model in Sinop by encouraging bed & breakfast entrepreneurship and small size tourism entrepreneurship.

In line with this purpose:

It builds coordination between boutique hotels, bed & breakfasts, rental homes, flats and rooms.

It sets and controls quality criteria.

It also provides services for common purchases, cleaning, repair; web based sales and reservation.

- Hal Shop:

It aims to revalue and protect lost cultural products and to add value to the economy.

In line with this purpose it works together with Design Workshop for sales and marketing of designs and products exclusive to Sinop.

Local and foreign designers were invited to Sinop recently. Working together with craftsmen and craftswomen, artists and small scale producers in Sinop, new products are designed with the slogan “Smells Like Sinop” and branding was created for current products. All products resulting from all this work are displayed

at HAL Shop. They will be commercialized in the future to contribute to local development.

- Kitchen Workshop:

It aims to support Sinop's local food culture to create sustainable economically benefits.

In line with this purpose:

Local food and ingredients in Sinop are studied and subjected to research.

Workshops with cooks are held.

A special menu exclusive to Sinop is created at the end of this workshop.

This menu is served at a restaurant that will be opened.

- Beekeeping Workshop: Güngör Erdem will explain this at the session to be held on January 16, Saturday.

- Gardening Workshop: We are not presenting this initiative which aims to beautify the city since it is not finalized.

Hal, Sinop Meeting Center is just at the bottom of the ladder and is about to be transformed. We started our path thanks to your support. We wish your support to continue and increase.

As we have woken up the giant that had been sleeping for 30-35 years, there are vigilantes willing to grab a room at HAL. Common benefits matter. HAL is a small model of the Prison. We have serious problems recently. There are people who want to puncture the structure we are trying to build [*Melih Görgün*].

Mahir Namur [European Cultural Association]:

Sinopale establishes participation. We developed it as we learnt it by doing it. Sinopale has been here for ten years but ten years I nothing is social development.

We definitely do not want the artists to bring readymade works. We invite artists to Sinop so that they can create their work as inspired by Sinop.

We actually want a lot from the artists. Not every artist can do that. We usually invite artists who work more with civil society and come

up with art work in shorter period of time.

We cannot see yet what is collected in Sinop since there is no contemporary art museum here. We tackled that in 2011 at Collecting the Future. This is best to be done with universities with artists.

All work created should be placed in that museum. It should be handled with other works as a whole.

Artists take culture out of the society to make it visible. Cevat Hoca asked people of Sinop what was valuable for them. Johanna collected them to start a one day museum. We have seen them with their stories. This needs to be handled at HAL by Sinop Historical and Cultural Research Association.

We organized an Oral History and Documentary Film Workshop at HAL which tried to make oral history visible through film.

All parties come together to do something for Sinop. Thanks to these activities Sinop has an image of a city with intellectuals.

We became a role model for Çanakkale and Mardin biennales.

As we organized Sinopale, we are in the participatory process of European Participatory Academy. We will enlarge “Hal Shop” in 2016. We learn as we run these projects.

As suggested by Ioannes yesterday, these experiences in Sinop should be turned into a school.

Sinopale is a tool to reveal cultural values and support social entrepreneurship. We can do all of that all together.

We are talking about a process of returning to the city. There needs to creation of added value to allow the city grow properly [*Melih Görgün*].

***Cemalettin Kaya [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management
Coordination and Advisory Board, Ayışığı Hotel]:***

Hasan Onur could not come so Cemalettin Kaya spoke instead:

When we first visited Governor Zeki Şanal for the Biennale, he said “You could do it during Sinop Festival”. The Governor realized how important Biennale activity is for Sinop after it was organized.

We learnt something during Mr Mahir’s closing remark in Istanbul: We

will share our ideas to share them with you not because we insist they are correct and you should accept them.

Notes by Hasan Onur:

Our city needs cultural values. You don't check the weather forecast when you leave for Amasra but you do check it if you leave for Sinop because people come to Sinop only for the sea.

Sinop's culture should be emphasized especially in the fields of faith, health, gastronomy, museum studies.

Faith tourism: We want civilizations to meet in our city. Greeks, Armenians, Turks have lived here. Excavations held during the construction of cultural center revealed that there had been a Jewish community here too.

Three million tourists visit Hagia Sophia every year; 300 thousand visit Anatolian Civilizations Museum. Tourists travelling for faith tourism have higher expenditures too.

Since Easter coincides with dead season for tourism in Sinop and why shouldn't it be seen as an opportunity?

A journalist reveals the sharp end of things.

Health tourism; A painting of Mithridates is on the wall of American Pharmacists Museum which has three Sinopeans in it. They have plants from Sinop. You know arsenic which grows around Durağan.

The immortality syndrome in medicine is called Mithridatum syndrome. Leeches of the island are healing.

There is white sand in the west of Sinop and black sand in the east of Sinop along the Black Sea. People used to bury themselves in black sand for rheumatism.

Another value is gastronomy. Years ago food contests were held on tourism weeks in Sinop. Then it became just one contest for *Nokul*. This nokul made by a lady from the island was fantastic.

Nokul is sailor's food which lasts long. You can eat it with one hand while you hold on the ropes in your boat.

Most expensive pizza is the one with anchovies which are stripped of their skin!

Around the old bus station they found out there used to be a fish market during the excavation held by Owen Doonan. We will also have salty fish contest in Sinop.

Another local food is ravioli which has gone beyond itself and needs to be standardized.

Museum studies; the museum is like a refrigerator. After thirty years display boxes are the same and no one can touch it. It is refrigeration business! We have history buried everywhere.

We would like the artifacts to be displayed in situ. Any level lost due to found artifacts in a building should be returned to the building owner as the right to add another storey.

Ali Yılmaz [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Advisory Board, Antik Hotel]:

Mahir's speech reminded me of old days. It was 2005 when the hotel was being built, Professor Melih came to me. I did not say anything not to break their morale but I thought "they have gone crazy". Now I am ashamed of what I thought then, I provide them with all the support I have.

There is an EU grant program in Sinop. I commemorate Özgür Özarslan with appreciation. I appreciate Seda Erdem too. The precondition for this project was that it would be a civil society project. Sinop area management is established and we represent civil society. This project has two stages. First one is the restoration of Historical Prison and second is area management plan.

We have hesitations of this project to be a civil society project. Since May there is a lack of dialogue. It is not like some will plan and we will sign it. Our main duty is to do this together with public.

Luchsinger stated that they have submitted this project to Ankara.

There is a lack of communication. We don't believe that this project is acceptable since this communication is lost even though this project turns out to be beautiful and correct and it is not done with civil society. Civil society would approve the project if they are allowed to participate in it.

Professor Melih had hesitations on Municipal implementations. I

don't agree with that. Municipality can make plans until area management committee approves the plan. But after the area management plan is approved then Municipality cannot make their own plans.

Area management plan is a plan for 30-40-50 years. Wrong doings can be demolished and corrected in time. What matters is that these incorrect doings do not appear in the area plan.

Hikmet Tosun [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Advisory Board, Sinop City Culture and Tourism Manager]:

It is not as pessimistic as Cemalettin Kaya had described! We provide information to those who come to us.

Sinop is an outdoor museum. Technology destroys everything that it does not recognize. Sinopale tries to protect all that and those that need to be protected in situ. The decision is made by Preservation Board not by us.

I explained my thought son area management in Istanbul. I participated in all studies made until May. I am aware of all stages of this project. I have read every line of 650 pages of tender contract.

Sinop is a city without plans. There is no development plan for preservation, tourism master plan or signage. We have added all of them into the project. We were really patient until May. We are not a party to this project as Sinop. One party is the company and the other is Treasury Undersecretary. The company was told that their only correspondence in Sinop is Area Management. We have established Area Management much earlier.

Prison is brought to the table in all these meetings. Prison is finished in May but we still about it. Prison projects are approved and done. We want the area management plan now. We want all cultural heritage areas in the city to be defined as a territory.

They want pedestrian corridors for the cruise tourists to wonder around the city in peace and we made a suggestion. First one is the route that connects Ethnography Museum, Yüksek Kaldırım and Balatlar Church; second route is the connection between Harbor, Kuruçeşme Street, Balatlar Church and Pancar Depot

(beetroot depot); third one is the corridor on Tuzcular Street. These corridors and sightseeing routes are not in the plan. We will open Balatlar Church to visitors soon. Wehdorn Company did not manage to perceive Sinop. Ms Bahar's work is better. Wehdorn has not discussed area management for eight months. I cannot give an account of this to public. He said he had submitted it to Ankara but still says it is being translated which is contradictory. We provide data to everyone. We have built area management plan not built by any other city in Turkey. Participation is wide. It should all be finished on May 15. These projects should have been delivered to the area management office ten months before that date.

Many came to me but I have not dealt with an academic individual in the scope of the plan. I have worries about the process.

I would like to thank Adem Tahtacı who collected thousands of signatures so that Prison can be transferred to Ministry of Culture. € 3 million of € 9 million will be sent to thirty centers. 3 million is the project's money. 3 million is for the restoration. People of Sinop don't need that money. Entrance fee for the prison is 5 TL, how many visitors does it have annually? But this money is not left with us but is sent to TÜRSAB. What matters now is the area management plan. How will it live and what will happen? I am tired of dealing with the past. This Forum is organized to tackle future. Then we should organize a Diogenes Forum and Mithridates Forum [*Cemalettin Kaya*].

I feel very bad that I have been the target of all criticism on Sinop Prison Project. We have sent the project in September but no one responded. I am open to dialogue. Now we have documents and we can discuss it all. We mentioned money. Our project has a budget of € 120 thousand. We cannot make traffic, tourism etc plans. This is a suggestive plan and is not for 50 years or so [*Christoph Luchsinger*].

It is a gain even to share lack of communication. Your learn about area management when you do it [*Bahar Aksel Enşici*].

SESSION 2: SINOP IN DEVELOPMENT II

Moderator: Yeşim Dizdaroğlu (ÇEKÜL)

Participants: Cengizhan Kaptan (Deyda Ecologic Camp)

İrem Ebru Kuru (EPEKA)

Erkan Akliman (Sinop Sustainable Development Association, European Volunteer Services Project Coordinator)

Mert Karaçıkay (İş-Porta Project)

Güngör Erdem (Beekeeping Project)

Volkan Kaya (Sinop Kayak Academy)

Ahmet Çobanoğlu (Sinop Diogenes Rotary Club)

Cemalettin Kaya (Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management Coordination and Auditory Board, Ayışığı Hotel)

Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Alpay Tırlı (Sinop Uni.)

All the works, alternative initiatives and studies organized by civil society and individuals in Sinop are explained and shared.

Cengizhan Kaptan [Deyda Ecologic Camp]:

He briefed on Deyda Ecologic Camp in Gerze which is prepared:

The camp planned to be open in 2017 will cover issues such as

agriculture, food production, tourism, education and energy. The goal of the camp is sustainability. There will be bed and breakfast services but those who are interested in these issues will be given accommodation. The farm will generate its own power. There will be three types of participants as stakeholders, participating families and supporting families.

İrem Ebru Kuru [EPEKA]:

We are sister organization to EPEKA Slovenia. The goal is to allow youth to benefit from common educational programs. We send young people abroad. We also host foreign young people and disabled volunteers here.

Erkan Akliman [Sinop Sustainable Development Association, European Volunteer Services Project Coordinator]:

Our association provided EU volunteer services. Since we are accredited we can receive and send volunteers to and from EU. The volunteers to arrive are not slaves and we pick qualified ones including artists.

Basic Turkish education will be provided for the volunteers. There is no condition of knowing a foreign language for those who will be sent abroad.

Mert Karaçıkay [İş-Porta Project]:

We would like to create visibility for local merchants and producers through İş-Porta project and create awareness. This is a tandem project and we work with partners. My partner is in Berlin. Since the budget is limited there is limited participation. It will be held in Sinop and Berlin. Sinop outcome will be presented in Berlin. You will see this vehicle [İş-porta] at the end of April and beginning of May on Sinop streets.

Do they have to be artists? Can they be craftsmen? Doesn't it support local handicrafts? *[Yeşim Dizdaroğlu]*

They could be handicraftsmen too.

Güngör Erdem (Beekeeping Project):

Beekeeping is an activity that existed in the past of Sinop. In 1930's Brother Adam of Ayancık Zingal Corporation smuggled three bees in a matchbox to generate Belfast race. Sinop bee is different than other bees, goes out in misty weather whereas other bees go out on sunny weather.

Sinop has Mediterranean plants which are important in beekeeping. I met a Professor from OMÜ who said they came back to Sinop last year to take more bees since Belfast race is degenerated.

We want to find sponsors in beekeeping fair. How does Çekül help us? The goal should be protecting the nature not exploiting it as an enterprise. Bees are the most sensitive link of natural cycle. Pesticides kill bees *[Yeşim Dizdaroğlu]*.

Volkan Kaya [Sinop Kayak Academy]:

I have been involved in sports at the university. I wanted to continue after I returned to Sinop but couldn't. What I could not do in Sinop, I have done it in Istanbul. I came back to Sinop. I am a

kayak instructor. The goal is raise life quality. If we can manage it we would like to start wind surfing. Every child growing in Sinop says “there is nothing to do here”. Actually there is!

Hopefully alternative tourism will flourish.

You are building an infrastructure to expand tourism into twelve months. You can go to Hamsilos, then to Inceburun with kayaks as well as bicycles. You can have plant tours. Akliman should not be covered with buildings and wetlands should be protected ...

[Yeşim Dizdaroğlu]

Ahmet Çobanoğlu [Sinop Diogenes Rotary Club]:

I talk on behalf of Aykut Yilmazer who is in Adana now:

We started in 2013. We organized a workshop and published the conclusions. As Rotary Club we don't deal with one subject. We took part in youth exchange program. We hosted 23 young people in two years. Ours won't leave! Families in Sinop are very protective.

We have activities for disabled people.

We have sent Cansu Kircan to an experts training program on rural and local development.

We are surrounded by sea in four directions in Sinop but people of Sinop are not into sea as required. There are children sailors but they won't continue. Sea is not utilized. We have a sea project. We will organize 1. Çapari (Trotline) Festival in September.

**Cemalettin Kaya [Sinop Cultural Heritage Area Management
Coordination and Auditory Board, Ayışığı Hotel]:**

What Mr Murat told about handicraftsmen not finding a place in the city, is nothing new, it was like that in the past. They used to open their stores outside the city which were called *gedik* (monopoly of trade right in Ottoman times).

Güngör mentioned bees. Mithridates used bees as his soldiers. There

were sewage men to conquer castles who used to dig tunnels.

When Romans dug tunnels, Mithridates sent bees underground and then bears.

There is archeological work in Sinop. Amphoras are made in Sinop. It is not the amphora which is valuable but what it has inside it. The scale of the content of the amphora was set by masters in Sinop.

British dug up Phokas Church. David French wrote the book of Sinop. Sinop is the land of retired sailors. Nisi village was quarantine area. They mentioned Balatlar excavations. They even dug out plastic, they had plastic in 1924. There is St Helen's in Thessaloniki.

They had a dig under the Sinop Diogenes sculpture. There is no problem of money but there is bureaucracy. The buildings around Balatlar are expropriated to be demolished. A member of City Council said: "these buildings are public now and they cannot be demolished" and we waited for a year.

USA's eye is on Sinop. The age of ceramic dug under the ground that never saw the sunlight can be dated using carbon dating method. There is no lab to determine the age of ceramic that have been exposed to sunlight on the ground in Turkey. It will be the first one to be built in Sinop.

Comments and Evaluation:

- ☐ Archeological sites revealed where the old hospital was are very important. There should not be any buildings here; it should be kept as a park *[Tufan Bilgili]*.
- ☐ Cleanliness matters in tourism *[Ahmet Tahtacı]*.
- ☐ She asked if what is told during the session has also been told to Ministry of Development or not *[Zeynep Aydınoglu]*.
- ☐ This is one of the best sessions held. I wish it was held in Istanbul too. Is KUZKA aware of all these activities? *[Aziz Konukman]*
- ☐ How can we reach young people? *[Nil İlkbaşaran]*

JANUARY 17, 2016, Sunday, Sinop

WORKSHOP 1: FUTURE PERSPECTIVES

Future perspective. How can I take part in it? How can I contribute to it? What is my role and responsibilities?

Moderator: Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours Association)

Ass. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ (MSGSÜ)

Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Participants are asked about what remained with them from Sinopale Forum and the only word defining the Forum:

Communication	Faith tourism	Insensitivity	Regional	Tolerance	Public	Method
Intimacy İmece	Responsible Tourism	development plan	lack of communication	space	Prison	Ministry of culture and tourism Sinopale
Boutique	"Nuclear" Tourism	Urban sprawl	Holistic	Cooperative	Social	Sinop Sustainable Development Association
Collaboration	Beekeeping	Apathy	Sakarya Street	Entrepreneurship	Cultural Heritage	Member
Solidarity Awareness	Area Management	Incentive		Workshops		Local authority
Needs of the Local	Human rights	Marina		Infrastructure		Central authority
Sustainability	Sinopeans	5 Star Hotel	Cultural	Superstructure		MSGSÜ
Empathy	Humans	Transmission		Politics		Professor Melih Mithridates creative industries Tarzan
Lack of participation	Active Citizens	Solution oriented		Education		Kemal Food-Job-Eating
Sharing	Responsibility Music	approach		Archaeology History		3 Million Euros Social investment Social media tangible / intangible Reaching youth
Transparency	Art Creativity	Project		Environment / nature		Governor
Accountability Owning	Stakeholder	Business world		Transformation		Mayor
Development	Sharing Economy	Seed exchange		Waste		Old city
Trust	Balance Collective	Archeological site		Follow up		Migration
Culture	"Stakeholder"	Authentic		Sea		Seasonal Population
Entrepreneurship	Concrete	"Don't Hurt first"		Amazon KUZKA		"Qualified manpower"
Fishing Volunteerism	Arab Tourism	Reconciliation		Urban culture Fishnet		Protection
Traffic	Cultural Trusts	Locally organized		Relationship network		
Urban Planning	Harbor	Public		Positive Approach		
participation	Learning	Helesa		Çapari Festival		
Marine Sports	Information Transfer	Fisherman2s wharf		Urban identity happy city		
Charitable collecting	Follow up	Participation Models		City culture		
the Future	Culture based			My green growing neighborhood		
Culture and Education	development			Street is ours		
Tourism						
Creating models						

I have been taking photos of village women going around in villages of Sinop for a long time now. I can open up an exhibition of these photographs. I would like to provide support in any work to draw the attention of women who come to the market place to raise their sales, improve their stalls, promote their products (a great variety of pears are grown in Sinop villages, these can be promoted and marketed by introducing their features) and register endemic species and special products *[Tülin Dizdaroğlu]*.

We can develop an initiative with village women. We can work to promote for the sales of the cheese they produce *[Büke Onur]*.

An inventory can be made by visiting villages of Sinop in terms of ethno-musicology. An inventory can be drafted by pinning down anonymous songs, and then these songs can be rearranged according to their authentic versions for a choir. Besides different choirs can be started in villages and at the center to sing local tunes together with such choirs. (*Yaşar Sarıkaya* already worked to collect village songs before) *[Alpay Tırıl]*

Positive and participatory ideas / projects in Sinop can be realized and if they are successful, ideas like nuclear power plant will be eliminated automatically. At this stage it is important to be a partner to nature and life. *[Alpay Tırıl]*

Sinop can lead investments if it can realize its own economy and support it. *[Alpay Tırıl]*

In order to do all that and for the sustainability of the projects, it falls a great deal on Sinop Sustainable Development Association and youth. They are willing to do that too. On the other hand it is essential adults should support the energy of youth with their experience. *[Alpay Tırıl]*

In order to find support to all work done communication and keeping each other informed matters a great deal. Those who work on Sinop or/and at Sinop should become a part of the established network which will improve the synergy. Besides, the process will gain speed when those in the centre of the network are more effective and take steps to solve problems. *[Alpay Tırıl]*

It is an interesting contradiction since they open Sarı Kum region for development while we discuss preservation of regional ecological values and emphasizing them. There should be efforts to work on the development decision. *[Alpay Tırıl]*

WORKSHOP 2: WHAT DO I NEED TO TAKE PART IN FUTUER PERSPECTIVES AND FULFILL MY RESPONSIBILITIES?

Moderator: Arzu Erturan (Street is Ours)
Ass. Prof. Dr. Kevser Üstündağ (MSGSÜ)
Recorded by: Ass. Prof. Dr. Bahar Aksel Enşici (MSGSÜ)

Words and concepts mentioned in the first session were grouped. In regards to themes set accordingly, the discussion was about what the participants could do in order to realize afore mentioned future perspective and what kind of contributions they can have:

What can be done in Sinop, what is needed?

It is essential that village women of Sinop are allowed to develop. Sinop has various types of cheese which need to be determined and product portfolio should be formed, the name of the villages where these cheese are from should be promoted (branding), workshops should be organized where these cheese can continue to be made traditionally and methods can be taught to youth, young people should be included in the production, there should be marketing and workshops should be handed over to young people [*Büke Onur*].

Women Labor Development Association has been working with women on a similar issue for 3 years now. Sinop's traditional products are locally made and sold at their shop but there has not been a step taken in food production. We can support Büke Onur with that idea [*Funda Akalın*].

“Social Entrepreneurship and Design for Local Development Workshop” that will be held this summer will tackle issues such as reproduction of local products, preparing prototypes and sales. This workshop should not be kept as a project only but should become an initiative. In order to do that starting a business, management, marketing and branding will also be tackled as subjects during the project [*Mahir Namur*].

Kitchen workshop or design shop within the body of HAL can also support cheese business [*Mahir Namur*].

An inventory of regional ancestral seeds can be prepared and seed exchange festivities can be organized. The project of “Seed to the

University” can be carried to Sinop too together with Buğday Association **[Aziz Konukman]**.

An inventory of special plants growing in villages (plants, mushrooms) can be prepared to raise awareness among villagers on characteristics of such plants so that they can be turned into products to be sold **[Mert Karaçıkay]**.

As it happens in Bektaşğa, there are several authentic village and local festivals in the region. Muhtars started supporting these festivals recently to draw attention to their villages. *Keşkek* (wheat and meat dish) festival, Hıdrellez (Turkish celebration of spring) celebrations are important in the region. It will be more appropriate to improve and emphasize already available festivals and celebrations in the region rather than organizing brand new activities both for the continuity of local values and communicating with local people **[Alpay Tırıl]**.

İmece (collective work) is required not just to initiate but for the continuity of all efforts placed. HAL building will be an incubation center but support is needed to complete the maintenance of the building. For example support can be provided for construction materials.

Bosch approved to be a sponsor to hand out household appliances in the kitchen workshop and air conditioners of offices at HAL. Such support is very important in terms of visibility and prestige **[Mahir Namur]**.

You don’t need to be a member to support Sinop Sustainable Development Association and participate in meetings. You can come to the meetings without being a member. Participation is essential in order to develop all such work, be informed and for communication **[Nil İlkbaşaran]**.

Enabling HAL to become a meeting place for everyone is very important in terms of continuation, support of projects and collaboration **[Nilüfer Sülüner]**.

How does it sound if we talked to contractors in the city and ask them to restore a room each in HAL and announce their names with a plate in these rooms?

There can be a support collected in the form of money through a common account to rearrange HAL. But the money collection and spending should be transparent and shared with everyone.

Currently a couple of spaces at HAL are arranged thanks to the means provided by the association. This is important in terms of visibility. Besides, membership, donations and all kinds of supports provided for the association are very valuable [T. Melih Görgün].

Majority of the participants at the meeting agreed that HAL should be a center and a common platform for communication and collaboration.

In order to extend the participation, we can go those who do not come to the meetings to make presentations and tell them about the projects. Young people, children, schools, senior citizens should not be left out of the participatory network. The association can even create common projects with the university.

It is important to set clear goals and implement them as well as sharing ideas.

In order to allow the communication and organization to continue, it is essential that there should be constant and permanent contact people for Sinop Sustainable Development Association in Sinop and Istanbul. If we can increase the support for the association we can employ 2 people. Besides it would be very efficient for visibility if we had a social media expert and a team. Social media experts can be consulted. Viral content, interesting visuals and shares draw more attention of young people. Every new social media account should function like a branch.

We should employ coordinators for the association (one for Istanbul and one for Sinop) as well as a marketing professional. We have to increase our member numbers and meet regularly to provide a budget for such employment. It is essential to keep minutes of meetings.

There can be easier ways of communication next to projects. For example there can be “Wisdom” talks once a week at HAL

or somewhere else. Such professional speeches or experience sharing will be attractive and even be effective in students' choice of profession.

Kuzguncuk example can be implemented here too. The school has a summer school program for its students and ask experts to explain their professions. Projects can be shared at these meetings too even together with students to learn more about them [*Kevser Üstündağ*].

Sinop is a school of sailing sports. Athletes and trainers from Sinop are very important in their field. This needs to have a higher visibility. There are Olympic Preparation Centers (TOHM) all around Turkey but no center for sailing. Provincial Sports Administration wants this center to be in Sinop and made attempts to realize it. How can these ideas be supported? [*Volkan Kaya*]

Likewise beach volleyball is very popular too.

Spastic Children Association initiated to start a rehabilitation center project. Association has land but is looking for a sponsor for arrangements [*Ferhat Şenoğlu*].

Sinop lacks infrastructure in gymnastics but has a lot of talented athletes. 30th in Turkey and 1st of the region are from Sinop. There is no facility and material sufficient for this sport; you need to go to Samsun for training. Such talents should be supported in Sinop.

It is essential to be aware of such issues and success stories and inabilities to come up with solutions. Sinopale can cover these issues and even Sinopsis can be published regularly not only during the Biennale to act as a tool of communication.

What do university students living in Sinop think? What are their problems, what can do to solve these problems? They should not be left out of the process [*Volkan Kaya*].

All the information collected here should be made visible. They can be published in local newspapers as a series of news.

Alpay Tırıl and Mert Karaçıkay stated that they can support to collect information and documents and writing process during Sinopsis work.

When we look at a newspaper from 1930, we see that most interesting news is the horse race held at Sülük Lake. There are a lot of people in Sinop from Caucasus and horseback riding is very important in Caucasus *[Alpay Tırıl]*.

Horse carts can be used for transportation *[Aziz Konukman]*.

Off-Road ,s harmful for the environment and it should be stopped *[Aziz Konukman]*.

Social Volunteers Foundation has a working system. We can bring that system to Sinop through someone who is interested in it which can function as Sinop branch. European Cultural Association can lead that initiative *[Mahir Namur]*.

Sinop becomes dirty in summer. People can be warned to separate their solid waste at home rather than tossing garbage away. So recycling can start and city would have extra economic income. Sinop Sustainable Development Association can educate people on that. I worked in Trabzon on this issue and I can provide all kinds of support if necessary *[Sami Koç]*.

People pay for the amount of garbage they take out in Europe. Students go to school on Saturdays to handle city cleaning *[Kevser Üstündağ]*.

There is someone who is working individually on waste oil. He collects it and takes it to places where it needs to be processed. There is a collection point next to Muhtar's office *[Erkan Aklıman]*.

We can prepare leaflets to raise awareness in public on recycling and hand them out through pharmacies. People read the leaflets they picked up at pharmacies more carefully with the perception that it is related to their health *[Mert Karaçıkay]*.

Tables at HAL are deformed. Mountable tables and chairs can be bought to be mounted back again by students of Professor Barış. They would own them since they put effort on it.

The importance of HAL, Sinop Meeting Center, Sinop Sustainable Development Association and Sinopale should be told to public. It would be better to start a local radio station to reach public faster.

We can shoot promotional videos of HAL and add them on Youtube,

open up a channel. HAL already has an inviting environment. Chairs can be fixed with an addition of 1-2 tables and some music so that it could be more attractive.

There should be different types of music broadcast at HAL. There should be Sinopsis etc and some material on tables. People should be able to spend good time there so that the shops in HAL can benefit from that (for example Mr Metin). City Council and Yerel Gündem 21 should definitely be a part of the process. They should be contacted [**Sami Koç**].

It is essential that everyone embraces and approves HAL. What about an activity on March 8 at HAL (charity sale, film screening, slide show)? [**Funda Akalın**]

It would be very important and efficient to print the outcome of Forum as a form of Sinopsis immediately and hand it out to all related parties. The coordination of preparation process can be handled by Yiğit Bahadır Kaya. The language and style used should be fluent and understandable; everyone from all walks of life should be able to understand it.

Alpay Tırl stated that he can have a lecture at the university on the approaches and projects of tourism to reach young people and invite speakers.

It is important Sinop Sustainable Development Association becomes an umbrella association in Sinop and establish communication and coordination amongst other NGOs. Active NGOs in Sinop work without being interactive with each other. Coordination is essential for efficiency.

It is stated that it is essential to run project based work to achieve efficient and tangible results. Running projects and the project culture should be developed in Sinop; it is important to provide training to support NNGOs in writing projects and inform them about fund possibilities. As I work as a project consultant, I can provide that support [**Ferhat Şanoğlu**].

Active citizens should work and civil society activities should be held. We have shared how we will live in the future together with civil society and how we will establish this [**Mahir Namur**].

Sinop: Culture and Creativity in Local Development

Bahar Aksel [Mimar Sinan University of Fine Arts]

Sinopale Forum 2016 has concluded as a widely participated activity with the title “Culture and Creativity in Local Development” aiming to clearly define Sinop’s potentials, making current and suggested projects visible, raising the communication between actors to a higher level, sharing local and foreign experiences. During its 10 year long past, Sinopale Forum has taken significant steps in Sinop to improve civil society dialogue and city’s culture-art based development and managed to bring the information together through this recent activity that will allow permanent steps to be taken in local economic development.

Discussions on how values exclusive to Sinop and culture can be utilized in terms of local economic development, what type of role civil entrepreneurship needs to embrace, how the projects conducted by development agency, governorship and local authority and civil initiatives can be coordinated and how to attain a common benefit when a common vision is adapted revealed projects that can be implemented in short term. Therefore methods are defined to practically implement subjects discussed in theory.

It is possible to define the actors conducting studies, work, projects and application on Sinop roughly in four layers: administration (central, local, ministry of culture, development agency etc.), university, civil society and investors. Works, studies, investments and embraced vision / approaches of these basic groups on Sinop are shared in depth throughout the Forum, therefore lack of communication affecting collaboration and coordination in a negative way is cleared at a great deal. As wide sharing platform and communicative environment allowed projects run by different actors to be associated with each other, it also facilitated new ideas to be born for activities and initiatives.

Forum’s sessions held in Istanbul included presentations directed at learning and sharing such as determinations of visions, definitions, good practice examples and national-international

experiences. These sessions also built the path to form the practical ideas that have emerged in Sinop sessions.

The first session bringing central and local authorities together with regional institutions is important in terms of sharing how Sinop partakes in upper scale decisions and how it is located in the national and regional vision. The presentation stating Sinop's potential bearing features and resources comparing them to the region and situation in Turkey carried the search for potential focusing only on the center of the city into a larger scale. Sectoral, natural and population based titles emphasized in the presentation has hints on how to foster a vision to support compatibility of Sinop in regional scale and also create a stronger local development model by bringing center and its periphery (natural areas and villages) together. Vision set by KUZKA and projects implemented by local authority cited new spatial improvements to be implemented in the near future in parallel to vision set for Sinop in regional scale.

Sinop Prison project currently is the largest scale project in Sinop in application process. The project prepared as with collaboration of European Union, Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Wehdorn Architekten and Vienna Technical University is an important example in terms of discussing a local value through international funds on international scale. Sinop Prison and Area Management Plan has been shared with masses and opened to discussion for the first time throughout Sinopale Forum. It is a positive approach that Prison which is historically valuable and important both for Sinop and Turkey is renewed by activating international funds, and also mentioned project is not limited to a cultural heritage restoration but planned, functionalized through civil society dialogue demanding that it is made physical – social part of the city.

But most criticized sections of the project have been stated that there was not sufficient communication set with civil society during its implementation, official and civil actors in Sinop were not enabled to participate in the process as required and flaws have

occurred in sharing. Top priority problems were many since required transparency, communication and feedback have not been provided in preparation of area management plan; no collaboration has been made with universities and civil society institutions who have been working on Sinop for a long time and opinions of institutions, experts and stakeholders were not consulted with. Since the communicative environment fostered by Sinopale Forum has provided an essential platform to determine and overcome these problems, it is approved by all parties involved at the end of all meetings efforts should be made to overrun such communication problems until the official conclusion date of Sinop Prison Project.

On the other hand, it is underlined that it would cause problems in terms of utilization of the building and its integration with the city since management plan of Historical Sinop Prison with the restoration in progress, its functions and plans how to use it are not yet clear. It is required to equip this important building for the city's core memory correctly with correct utilization so that it would be brought back to city and society.

The approaches for urban development have been tackled through best practices in the world both on the centerline of Sinop and Creativity and Culture. In regards to Sinop, "Tourism city" vision that emerges in upper scale and regional scenarios is questioned due to the negative impact of investments focusing on one single field. Turkey's geopolitical position and regional development have the first impact on tourism sector. Besides, as Sinop's tourism capacity is defined through sea-sand –sun, the orientation is far from current tourism approaches and Experience Tourism vision which has a higher added value. It is not only the fact that single sector based investment approaches are inefficient but tourism sector has a fragile structure which could have adverse effects on Sinop in the long term. So it is important that investments should be diversified in terms of sectors, culture and education should be prioritized, natural environment and shoreline should be sustainably utilized in

order to support the economic structure.

Within the scope of creativity and sustainability, it is observed that it is more valuable for development of cities in terms of sustainability where dwellers are supported with culture, arts and education and are provided with an environment enabling innovative ideas to emerge and be implemented. Cities offering its dwellers with good environments in terms of social and spatial capacities reach higher values in life quality, thus they become advantageous in terms of continuity of common benefits. Sinop will automatically become a point of attraction as it will have achieved to bring its spatial quality to a higher level fed by cultural, artistic and historical values it inherits and the attractiveness of living environment will support tourism.

Role of universities in increasing knowledge and information on Sinop cannot utterly be underestimated. All studies carried out including excavation works and urban scale studies diversify and deepen the information created about Sinop. The new created information and knowledge will provide the inspiration and infrastructure for alternative / innovative ideas to emerge.

Following the rhetoric discussions held in Istanbul, especially the workshops conducted in Sinop carried the spectators directly into active participation and interventions with the question “what can I do?” directed at them through the interactive methods deployed beyond determining the traces left in minds by Sinopale Forum activity. This allowed emergence of tangible activity and business ideas that can be implemented and even defining collaborations among participants.

In order to turn business ideas into reality, it is really needed for private sector to support local entrepreneurs financially or in terms of sharing experiences. Through the perspective of private sector such partnerships or support provided for civil society have positive effects on the company / firm value. This win-win working model with positive effects should definitely be activated more in Sinop. Private sector’s demand at this point is transparent sharing of how their support is utilized and have

realistic outcomes.

Sinopale Forum 2016 formed a comprehensive frame for Sinop to develop by utilizing its own potentials without requiring other central investments and progress as a city of culture and education. Information and experiences shared in this framework have established new Implementary and working titles for the administrative level and researches and workshops organized in Sinop allowed definition of entrepreneurial ideas that can quickly be implemented. It is very valuable to achieve concretized ideas, possible collaborations and clear job definitions in order to carry them into action and immediate results in the vision of making Sinop a city of culture and education.

The primary key to the sustainability of all the work is to execute all emerging ideas in collective work / imece, involve everyone in every step taken, allow everyone to share all benefits and experiences and everyone to own and claim the whole process. HAL Meeting Center take on the task to be an incubation center for all the executed work but will in time disperse all implemented ideas to different locations in time as participation and experiences become widespread.

Sinopale Forum also in search of methods for sustainability of development as it sets off with the goal to embrace a society based approach in regards to local economic development. Sinop is not only a main connection within local, national and international networks for experiences and information to be shared, it also offers a platform to share its own experiences in the future too.

This production is produced with financial support of the EU and Republic of Turkey.
European Cultural Association is responsible from the content of this document and
can in no way be interpreted as the opinion of the EU and/or Republic of Turkey.

Bu yayın Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nin mali desteğiyle üretilmiştir.
Bu yayının içeriğinden sadece Avrupa Kültür Derneği sorumludur ve hiçbir şekilde Avrupa Birliği veya
Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nin görüşlerini yansıttığı şeklinde yorumlanamaz.



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

This project is co-funded by The EU and The Republic of Turkey



Wehdom Architekt



Bu etkinlik "IPA - Ortak Kültürel Miras için Teknik Destek: Koruma ve Türkiye ile AB Arası Diyalog [Aşama-I]" kapsamında gerçekleştirilmektedir

This event is organized within the framework of "IPA - Technical Assistance for Common Cultural Heritage: Preservation and Dialogue between Turkey and the EU [Phase I]"

Organizasyon/Organized by



chameleon
tasarım ve proje yönetimi

SİNOPALE

Sinopale Forum bir Avrupa Kültür Derneği etkinliğidir.

Sinopale Forum is an event of Avrupa Kültür Derneği.

İşbirliğiyle / in cooperation with



H Sinop
AL Buluşma
Merkezi

SİNOP
SÜRÖBÜLEBİLİR
KALKINMA
DERNEĞİ

informal
görgün
network

MİMAR SİNAN
FINE ARTS
UNIVERSITY
Faculty of Fine Arts

SOKAK
BİZİM

ISBN 978-605-88140-7-3

